

FROM SMYRNA TO STEWARTSTOWN: A NUMISMATIST'S  
EPIGRAPHIC NOTEBOOK

By DAVID WHITEHEAD, MRIA

School of Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies, The Queen's University  
of Belfast

[Received 22 May 1998. Read 1 October 1998. Published 23 December 1999]

ABSTRACT

The paper concerns an anonymous nineteenth-century notebook—currently in Northern Ireland—containing transcripts of over two hundred ancient Greek and other inscriptions from the eastern Mediterranean. An appendix to the paper catalogues these contents and contextualises them in modern bibliography. In sections 1–4 the book's original owner/compiler is shown, by internal and external evidence, to have been Henry Perigal Borrell (1795–1851), best known as an amateur scholar of numismatics and a supplier of coins via the Bank of England to the British Museum. Sections 5–9 then ask how the book travelled from Borrell's home in Smyrna (Izmir) to Stewartstown, County Tyrone. The key figure in that journey is identified as James Kennedy Bailie, MRIA (1793–1864), rector of Ardrea, County Tyrone, who repaid Borrell's generosity in sending him the book by plagiaristically publishing many of its items. After Bailie the line of transmission was through one of the prominent Huguenot families of the area.

Introduction

I present here the results of my study of a manuscript notebook written by an accomplished amateur antiquarian who was active (as will be seen) in the Aegean and the Levant during the second quarter of the nineteenth century.<sup>1</sup>

The book's present owner is Mr James Glendinning of Stewartstown, County Tyrone, who deposited it for scrutiny at the Ulster Museum in Belfast in July 1997. Winifred Glover, Curator of Ethnography at the Museum, entrusted it to me, and I am indebted to her and to Mr Glendinning for the stimulating opportunity that has thus unexpectedly come my way.

The book is unsigned, and its immediate provenance appears at first sight to offer no clues to its ultimate origin. Mr Glendinning, a member of the Stewartstown and District Local History Society, acquired it (amid a boxful of miscellaneous antiquarian bric-a-brac) *c.* 1990 from the widow—herself now also deceased—of a friend of his, one of the Society's founder-members. Revd David Bothwell, Church of Ireland rector of the parishes of Donaghenderry and Ballyclog (in the diocese of Armagh) between 1947 and 1983, was, according to Mr Glendinning, an avid collector of second-hand books and the like, which he purchased from such outlets as the street market held every Saturday in Cookstown and from

<sup>1</sup>I would like to acknowledge the assistance of the following with this paper: Dr Derek Beattie, Mr Dennis Borrell, Mr Edwin Borrell, Revd Paul Dundas, Prof. Christian Habicht, Prof. Paulina Karanastassi, Dr Antony Keen, Ms Mary McVeigh, Dr Paul Magdalino, Mr Andrew Meadows, Mrs Bronagh Liddicoat, Prof. Nicolas Oikonomides, Prof. Georg Petzl, Prof. Brian Scott, Prof. Dimitris Tsougarakis.

various market stalls in Belfast. This picture of wholly local acquisition, within Ulster, is confirmed by Revd Bothwell's daughter Mrs Bronagh Liddicoat (of Lewes, Sussex), who was kind enough to respond to my interrogations on the point. She considers it most unlikely that her father either brought the notebook back, or had it sent, from England (let alone beyond).

This being so, an open mind must be kept—for the moment at least—on whether the book has any authentic Hibernian connections. As will emerge below, its first and in every sense prime owner can be identified with certainty on the basis of circumstantial evidence, and he turns out to have been no Ulsterman. Prominent amongst his associates, though, was a man from Rostrevor, County Down. I shall also demonstrate that the book later came into the clutches of an earlier and altogether less likeable-sounding Armagh cleric.

### 1. The notebook summarily described

Measuring some 180mm × 240mm, the book extends to 180 substantive pages (of which one leaf, the erstwhile pp 104–5, has been razored out). The pages are numbered in pencil in their top outside corners, with even numbers recto. Indexing begins on p. 181 (Lycian locations, in ink) and p. 182 (general index, in pencil) but is not pursued to completion.

The even-numbered pages carry careful majuscule transcripts, in faded black ink, of 212 ancient inscriptions (see Pl. I for a sample page). Five are Latin documents (*21*,<sup>2</sup> *88*, *93*, *94* and *130* in the Appendix), five Lycian (*43*, *85*, *97*, *98*, *99*), one bilingual Greek-and-Lycian (*39*), one bilingual Greek-and-Phoenician (*25*), one apparently bilingual Greek-and-Latin (*90*), and a group of ten (as it cost me some effort to discover) Nabataean Aramaic (*68–77*). The rest—which is to say the overwhelming majority—are Greek.

Although the sites in question range from Corfu (*10*) to Salonica (*14*, *82*) to Crete (*17*) to the Sinai desert (*68–77*), the main focus is on islands of the southern and eastern Aegean, such as Keos and Kos, and especially on the cities of—in ancient terms—Ionia, Caria, and Lycia.

In some cases the writer indicates that he has copied a document from someone else's journal. Where he does not say this, such copying may often, nevertheless, be assumed. On occasion he appears to invite the assumption that he is working from autopsy; in any event he indicates that he possesses several of these inscribed stones (*11*, *18*, *58*, *59*, *60*, *62*, *64*, *96*).

The book has also passed through later hands. I am insufficiently expert in palaeography to say with certainty how many, but it is evident that at least one other nineteenth-century individual—a classical scholar of very considerable erudition—has provided many of the plain majuscule transcripts with miniscule versions and/or Latin commentaries, citing *Corpus inscriptionum Graecarum*<sup>3</sup> numbers where they exist and adducing a wealth of other ancient and (then-)modern reference material.

### 2. Dates and names

All modern dates mentioned in the notebook fall within the period 1820–41:

<sup>2</sup>Numbers in italics refer to the inscriptions as numbered in bold in the Appendix below.

<sup>3</sup>Hereafter cited as *CIG*. For full bibliographical details of this and other frequently cited abbreviated bibliographical sources, see the list of Abbreviations before the Appendix.

54

From *Lea*

*Böckh*. p. 285. n. 2357.

ΔΙΜΟΚΑΙΙΧΚΥΘΟΝΙΣΔΟΞΕΝΤΗΒΟΥΛΗ  
 ΚΑΙΤΟΙΔΗΜΟΙΚΕΙΔΗΗΤΗΣΙΚΛΗΣΑ  
 ΓΑΟΣΦΑΚΥΘΟΝΙΟΣΙΑΒΟΙΚΩΝΧΙΚΑΡΘΑ  
 ΙΑΙΕΤΗΠΟΛΛΑΣ ΝΙΣ ΠΡΟΣΘΗΓ  
 5 ΣΙΩΝΩΣΙΣΙΝΟΥΣΟΝ ΕΣΔΗΜ  
 ΩΝΩΙΚΑΡΘΑΙΕΩΝΚΑΙΣΥΚΙΠΑΛΟ  
 ΕΜΝΟΛΟΙΑΕΧΟΥΟΑΙΣΩΙΔΙΜΩ  
 ΙΣΙΒΔΞΑΗ ΑΡΗΤΗΣΕΝΕΚΕ  
 ΝΚΑΙΚΥΘΟΙΑΣΚΑΙΣΙΝΑΤΩΙΟΝΙΟΝΙ  
 10 ΤΗΝΚΑΙΤΟΥ ΙΚΤΥΣΑΥΤΟΥ  
 ΑΡΙΚΗΟΙΑΣ ΩΣΤΗΣΗΑΡΧΗ  
 ΑΝΕΤΙΕΝΤΗΟΙΜΙΚΟΥΙΝΑΙΑ

v. s. ΗΓΗΣΙΚΛΗ.  
 In marmore *Lea*  
 No. 2355. s. memo-  
 ratur quidam *Herzsch*

v. 12. ΓΗΣΚΑΙΟΙΚΟΥ.

--- δήμος καὶ ἐν Κυθῶν. Ἐδοξε τῇ Βουλῇ καὶ τῷ Δήμῳ. Ἐπειδὴ Ἥγη-  
 σιλάης Ἀγαθοφάνους Κίθκιος παροικῶν ἐν Καρθαίᾳ ἔτη πολλὰ, ἐν μὲν τῷ  
 ἔμπεροσθερ χρόνῳ εὐνοῦς ὡν διατελεῖ τῷ δήμῳ τῶ Καρθαίων, καὶ εὐτά-  
 χτως δὲ ἐνδημῆι ἐν τῇ πόλει. Δεδόχθαι τῷ Δήμῳ ἑπαυρέουσι Ἥγησιμέλει τῆς  
 ἀρετῆς ἔρεκεν καὶ εὐνοίας, καὶ εἶναι αὐτὸν πολίτην καὶ τοὺς ἐγχρόνους αὐτοῦ  
 καὶ τῆς πόλεως τῆς Καρθαίων, ἔτι δὲ γῆς καὶ οὐκίας εἶναι αὐτοῖς ἐγκρη-  
 σιν, καὶ μετέχειν αὐτοὺς πάντων ὡπερ καὶ οἱ ἄλλοι Καρθαῖοι μετέχουσιν. [ἀνα-  
 γράφει δὲ τὸδε τὸ ψήφισμα πρὸς τῶν νεῶν τοῦ Ἀπολλωνίου. τὸ δὲ ἀνάλωμα  
 τὸ γενόμενον δοῦναι τὸν ταμίαν.]

*Böckh* *Böckh*. ex *Εσμ. λογ.* ann. 1818. 1819. *Apprindstat.* Tab. XX. n. 8.  
 In v. 1. comparant --- ΛΗΣΕΙΠΕΝ, contra fidem marmoris. In v. 4. intulit  
 MEN. In v. 6. (No. 5-6.) legit ΕΥΤΑΚΤΕΣΔΕΚΑΙ etc. deim ΗΓΗΣΙΚΛΕΑ, εἰς-  
 το ΤΗΣ. In 11. (No. 10.) exulat ΑΕΙ. In 12. non comparat in *Böckh* qui sup-  
 plet ut *Lea* n. 2353. ult. ex formula nota.

In v. 1. marmoris petrae *Herzsch*, *Cytherea*, cum papale caput discretum  
 fuerat potius communitatum: sed lapis praeter certum notat. De *Cytherea*  
 (nunc *Herzsch*, ob aquas calidas) vide *Plin.* IV. 22. 2. In v. 4. δ' ἔμπεροσθερ  
 χρόνος erat graeco adhuc in *Cytherea* deperet *Herzsch*. *Lea* praeterea in  
 v. 6. ἐν μὲν τῷ ἔμπερ. χρ. --- νῦν δὲ καὶ εὐ etc. sed ad amissionem cautelat *Lea*  
 n. 2353. ult. est ab insularibus.

PL. I—Sample page from numismatist's notebook.

'Inscription found [...] in 1832' (4); 'Inscription found [...] in 1820 [and copied] in 1826' (13); '1837' (15); 'Sent to England in 1836' (18). 'Copied March 1825 [and] collated with [another copy] in 1833' (20). 'Copied [...] Novr 1833' (39); 'Inscription found lately [and copied in] March 1831' (57); 'Jany 1831' (58); 'Copiée en xbre 1833' (88);<sup>4</sup> 'Inscription trouvée [...] en 9bre 1832' (90); 'Copiées en 9bre 1832' (91–92); 'Fragment [...] découverte en 9bre 1832' (93); 'Inscription trouvée en 9bre 1832' (94); 'Found [...] in 1833' (96); 'May 1841' (132); '1837' (160); '1837' (202).

It should also be remarked that inside the book's front cover, loose-leaf, are four cuttings from the London *Times* containing news dispatches from Syria. The reverse of one of them gives the date 28 October 1842.

As to names: leaving aside those, mainly from the later hand(s), that form part of references and commentary, a score of individuals are named in the course of the notebook. The following are the names as used (whether correctly or not):

ABRAHAM (63)

ARUNDELL (90, 91–2, 93, 94)

D'AVENAT (123)

BARON DE BEHR (132)

DR [?]BIGHY (20)

BREUVERY/BREUVERIE (28, 40, 46, 161, 167)

BRONSTED (13)

DE CADALVENE (8, 13, 15, 28, 40, 46, 49, 107, 161, 167)

A. DETHIER (78, 88, 90, 91–2, 93, 94, p.103)

STEFANO [?]GASNERI (13)

KIRIAKO (34) [surely = KIRIAKOS PHAIDROS below]

DR LEE (18)

JENS PELL (132, 160, 202, 212)

KIRIAKOS PHAIDROS OF SMYRNA (89) [surely = KIRIAKO above]

'MR R' (1, 2)

D. ROSS (4, 5, 39, 43, 57, 85, 97, 98, 99, 107, 108, 111, 117, 130, 169–71, 189, 197, 200)

DR SINCLAIR (4, 5)

SMITH (19)

J.R. STEUART (25)

BARON WOLFF (63, 89)

Some of the above-mentioned were notable antiquarian figures of their time:

Revd Francis Vyvyan Jago Arundell (1780–1846), a Cornishman, was British Chaplain of the Levant Company at Smyrna between 1822 and 1834, made extensive antiquarian tours of Asia Minor and wrote up accounts of the tours and

<sup>4</sup>The phenomenon of this and other entries involving French is examined below (see notes 17 and 74).

<sup>5</sup>Source: *DNB*, vol. 2, 143–4 (entry by W.P. Courtney). Arundell's work cited in the notebook is his *Seven Churches*, i.e. *A visit to the Seven Churches of Asia; with an excursion into Pisidia; containing remarks on the geography and antiquities of those countries, a map of the author's routes, and numerous inscriptions* (London, 1828). Six years later, his *Discoveries* described his six weeks of travels in autumn 1832 with Anton Dethier (see note 9 below). Another, and vital, member of Arundell's party, the Greek guide 'Kyriacos', is beyond much doubt the notebook's 'M. Kyriako' (34), a.k.a. 'Monsieur Kiriakos Phédros de Smyrne' (89) (see section 8 below).

findings. Our copyist cites him published (under 22 and 34) as well as unpublished.<sup>5</sup>

François Jean Désiré, Baron de Behr (1793–1869) is described, thumbnail fashion, in the *Index bio-bibliographicus notorum hominum* (IBNH) as ‘diplomate, historien, numismate’.<sup>6</sup>

The Copenhagen Peter Oluf Brøndsted (1780–1842) began many years of Mediterranean travelling in 1810; for a time he was Danish papal envoy to Sicily and the Ionian islands; and part of his *Reisen und Untersuchungen in Griechenland*, published in 1826, was devoted to Keos.<sup>7</sup>

Edmond-Pierre-Marie de Cadalvène (1799–1852) was *Directeur des postes françaises* at, successively, Alexandria, Smyrna and Constantinople, a publisher of coins and a commentator on current affairs.<sup>8</sup>

(Philipp) Anton Dethier, a pupil of the great August Boeckh (1785–1867) in Berlin, became a travelling-companion and associate of Arundell's. He then went on, in the 1850s and 1860s, to publish both Greek and Byzantine inscriptions.<sup>9</sup>

Dr Lee is evidently the collector and Levantine specialist John Fiott Lee (1783–1866),<sup>10</sup> and his medical colleague, Dr Sinclair, is perhaps the navy surgeon Andrew Sinclair (d. 1861), better known—from 1834 onwards—as a naturalist in South America and Australia.<sup>11</sup>

In 1837 Jens Pell (another Dane?) travelled in Ionia, Pisidia, Lycia, Pamphylia, Cilicia and Lycaonia, copying inscriptions he saw there.<sup>12</sup>

J.R. Steuart published a collection of *Antiquitates Atticae* as well as taking copies—supplied to others—of documents from Lydia.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>6</sup>Source: *IBNH*, vol. 14 (1978), 472.

<sup>7</sup>Source: Larfeld, 27 with 33.

<sup>8</sup>Source: J. Balteau and others, *Dictionnaire de biographie française* (Paris, 1933–), vol. 7 (eds Michel Prevost and Robert d'Amat, 1956), col. 784 (the entry on his father, an opportunistic politician). The books mentioned are: *Recueil des médailles grecques inédites* (1828; under the first name Édouard, for some reason); *L'Égypte et la Turquie de 1829 à 1836* (1836); *Histoire de la guerre de Méhémet Ali* (1837); *Deux années de l'Orient, 1839–1840* (1840). I can find no separate information on de Cadalvène's occasional (?) companion Breuverie. For copies by Cadalvène and/or Breuverie—from Halikarnassos, Knidos and Mylasa—see *Fasciculus*, nos 102 (*CIG*, no. 2656*b*), 103, 104, 105; *LW*, nos 502, 504, 506, 507, 511, 512.

<sup>9</sup>Sources: *LW*, no. 745 (misspelling the name as ‘Detiers’); Larfeld, 35 and 48 with 55. Dethier is called a Kölner by Larfeld and a Frenchman by J.E. Sandys (*A history of classical scholarship* (3 vols, Cambridge, 1903–8; reprinted New York, 1958), vol. 3 (1908), 383) but was in truth, it seems, Belgian. At any rate, Arundell writes in *Discoveries*: ‘I was favoured with an excellent *compagnon de voyage* in Mr Dethier, the accredited agent of the Belgian government’, ‘probably [?] at present the consul for the Belgian government at Smyrna’ (vol. 1, 1 and xiii respectively). Arundell's evident affection for Dethier emerges delightfully from the pages of *Discoveries*, as, between sketching ruins and shooting birds for the pot, the younger man, e.g., compares a mineral spring at Sarigu with the one at Spa (vol. 1, 68), recollects a story in Boccaccio (vol. 1, 357) and rescues a trapped buffalo calf (vol. 2, 197–9).

<sup>10</sup>Source: *DNB*, vol. 32 (1892), 362–3 (entry by G.S. Boulger). For my identification see F.M. Heichelheim, ‘The Greek inscriptions in the Fitzwilliam Museum’, *JHS* 62 (1942), 14–20: 16 (VII*b*, no. 1), who names a one-time owner of the notebook's 18 (‘now the property of Dr Lee’) as ‘J.F.’ Lee.

<sup>11</sup>Source: *DNB*, vol. 52 (1897), 289–90 (entry by G.S. Boulger).

<sup>12</sup>For copies by Pell in *LW* (\* = explicitly 1837) see there nos 21\* (Smyrna), 1197\* and 1198 (both Sagalassos), 1199 and 1200 (both Cremna), 1340 (Olympos), 1356 (supposedly Phaselis, but see 160), 1371\* and 1373\* (both Perge), 1377\* (Silyon), 1381 and 1382 (both Aspendos), 1385 (Side), 1388 (Kelerenderis), 1807 and 1808 (Derbe).

<sup>13</sup>For the *Antiquitates Atticae* see, e.g., *CIG*, nos 176, 221, 223, 225, 234, 312, 313 (see 57), 322. For copies by Steuart of non-Athenian documents see *Fasciculus*, nos 163, 173, 176, 177, 183; *LW*, no. 679 (*CIG*, no. 3447).

Baron Wolff was a Russian and presumably another diplomat; epigraphic transcripts made by him found their way into the standard collections.<sup>14</sup>

### 3. The copyist's circle—and his own identity

Our copyist, then, moves in an international circle of like-minded persons who freely share with each other what they have seen and recorded. Witness, for instance, item 13: 'Inscription found at the island of Amorgos in 1820 by Stefano [?]Gasneri. Communicated by him to M de Cadalvene who has published it without acknowledgement, in his "Recueil de Médailles grecques Inédits" Tom I pag 225. I believe it is also published by Chev[alie]r Bronsted, to whom I gave a copy in 1826. My copy differs from the one published by Cadalvene in the last line but one—I have TEIMHT and not TETIMHT'.

The bulk of the individuals listed in section 2 above are indeed men who are keeping their own 'journals' (the preferred term here)—and none more zealously, it would seem, than the figure mentioned in the very early pages: 'Mr D. Ross' (4), 'D. Ross of Bladensburg' (5 and *passim* thereafter), known to readers of LW as the source of many of their items. Besides avoiding confusion with his better-known contemporary and namesake Ludwig Ross (1806–59),<sup>15</sup> this full version of his name enables us to identify the man: David Ross-of-Bladensburg (1804–66). LW, at no. 1344, call him a Scot ('le voyageur écossais'), though misleadingly. While the Ross family did, in fact, originate in the Border country between Scotland and England, they crossed the Irish Sea to County Down in the early seventeenth century, settling first at Portavo, near Donaghadee, and subsequently (c. 1690) further south on an estate in Rostrevor. David Ross was the eldest son of the celebrated Major-General Robert Ross, whose defeat of American rebel troops at the Battle of Bladensburg, Maryland, in 1814—which enabled him to advance on Washington and, famously, burn the White House—led a delighted Prince Regent to allow his widow and successors, in perpetuity, to style themselves Ross of Bladensburg.<sup>16</sup>

Since our copyist states that he is drawing on the journals of Ross, de Cadalvène, Pell and the rest, he himself is most unlikely (unless he were indulging in grammatical and syntactical mischief) to be any of those thus named and referred to in the third person.<sup>17</sup> However, there are, in any case, positive grounds for deducing that he was H.P. Borrell (see Plate II).

Borrell's name is best known in numismatic circles. The following is the (unattributed) entry on him in the *DNB*:

<sup>14</sup>Baro Wolffius Russus': see Johannes Franz at *CIG*, nos 3818 (see 63), 3819 (see 89), 3820, and elsewhere.

<sup>15</sup>The author of, amongst other works, *Reisen auf den griechischen Inseln des ägäischen Meeres* (3 vols, Stuttgart and Tübingen, 1840–5), and several studies pertaining to Athens. See generally Larfeld, 42 with 52–3. (For L. Ross's *Inscriptiones Graecae ineditae* (*IGI*) and *Hellenika* see Abbreviations below.)

<sup>16</sup>David Ross of Bladensburg is, accordingly, not to be confused with his slightly older cousin and namesake David Robert Ross (1797–1851), MP for one of the two Belfast seats from 1842 to 1847 and briefly (1851) governor of Tobago. This confusion mars an otherwise useful journalistic feature on the family in the *Mourne Observer* of 7 July 1983; see now David Whitehead, 'David Ross of Bladensburg: a nineteenth-century Ulsterman in the Mediterranean', *Hermathena* 164 (1998), 89–99.

BORRELL, H.P. (d. 1851), numismatist, after learning business in London, established himself as a trader in Smyrna, where he resided for thirty-three years. He devoted much of his attention to the discovery of inedited Greek coins, in which he was remarkably successful. The results of his discoveries were given in papers contributed to the 'Revue Numismatique', the 'Numismatic Chronicle', and various German periodicals devoted to numismatic science. In 1836 he published at Paris 'Notice sur quelques médailles grecques des rois de Chypre'. His collection of coins, antiquities, and gems was sold at London in 1851. He died at Smyrna 2 Oct. of the same year.<sup>18</sup>

The entry in Frederic Boase's *Modern English Biography* is a recognisable abridgment of this while adding, from no stated source, a couple of extra details (here italicised):

BORRELL, *Henry Perigall*. Learnt business in London; merchant at Smyrna 1818 to death; very successful in discovery of inedited Greek coins; author of 'Notice sur quelques médailles grecques des rois de Chypre', Paris 1836, and of papers in 'Revue Numismatique', 'Numismatic Chronicle', and various German numismatic periodicals; his collection of coins, antiquities and gems was sold in London 1851. d. Smyrna 2 Oct. 1851 *aged 56*.<sup>19</sup>

Most of these statements can be accepted as they stand. It is certainly the case that Borrell published many numismatic articles and the short monograph men-

<sup>17</sup>This commonsense principle needs no labouring, although its application to the present case is, admittedly, affected by the French element in the book. The brief parentheses in a French hand under 12 and 16 do not seem to be attributable to the original copyist, but the Latin and French translations of 31 do, and so do the unexpected French lemmata and comments on 46, 47, 63 and 78. This is our copyist simply exercising his command of modern as well as ancient languages. However, something different appears to happen between 88 and p. 103; the hand changes perceptibly, and the name Dethier is mentioned five times, twice (90 and p. 103) in a way most naturally construed as suggesting that he is now the writer (see, e.g., under 90: 'Mr Arundell a cru que les mines de Suleimani marquaient l'emplacement d'Allydda, mais je suis porté à croire que c'est plutôt la ville de Klanudda. A. Dethier.'). I see no option but to believe that the notebook's owner lent it for a while to Anton Dethier (on whom see section 2, note 9, above). See section 8 below for further discussion.

<sup>18</sup>*DNB*, vol. 5 (1886), 406. Most of the material for this entry, I find, is furnished by the first of the following two sources: the obituary in *The Gentleman's Magazine*, New Series 39 (1853), 324—which itself draws on a report to the Numismatic Society (of which Borrell was a 'Foreign Associate')—and Maximilian Borrell's paper 'Regal Syrian tetradrachms found at Tarsus', read to the Numismatic Society on 24 June 1852 and published in *Numismatic Chronicle* 15 (1852–3), 40–57; the latter source actually says little about the writer's (by then) late brother. H.P. Borrell's own work is to be found in numerous reports to the Society, transmitted from Smyrna, in *Numismatic Chronicle* issues of the 1840s (see pp 202–3 of the index in vol. 20 thereof).

<sup>19</sup>Frederic Boase, *Modern English Biography* (6 vols, London, 1892–1921; reprinted 1965) (hereafter cited as *MEB*), vol. 1 (1892), vol. col. 341.



PL. II—Henry Perigal Borrell (1795–1851).

tioned.<sup>20</sup> The reviewer of the latter declared his ‘pride and pleasure in reminding our readers that its author is an Englishman, resident in Smyrna’ (*Numismatic Chronicle* 2 (1839–40), 51), though the evidence for when that residency began is not entirely congruent. On the one hand, in his own preface to *Notice sur quelques*



*médailles grecques des rois de Chypre* Borrell wrote, on 15 August 1836, that he had by then passed 'un séjour de quinze années en Turquie'; the beginning of these fifteen years must presumably be placed in 1821. On the other hand, we have the *DNB*'s 'thirty-three years' in Smyrna, which must extend back from 1851 to 1818 (thus explicitly in *MEB*, above); likewise, the catalogue for the auction held in July 1852 by Messrs Sotheby and Wilkinson aimed to sell 'The Choice Collection of Greek, Roman, Byzantine and Mediaeval Coins formed during a residence of upwards of thirty years in the Levant by the late H.P. Borrell, of Smyrna, Knight of the Greek Order of the "Saviour"; Corresponding Member of the Archaeological Institutes of Rome and Berlin, Etc. Etc.'<sup>21</sup> Evidently one of these calculations has gone slightly awry. Broadly speaking, however, Borrell was 'of Smyrna' in the 1820s and 1830s.

I have already described H.P. Borrell of Smyrna as 'an expatriate Englishman', following the lead of others in doing so.<sup>22</sup> Yet there turns out to be rather more to be said. The Borrells, clock- and watch-makers, were actually an expatriate Swiss family. H.P.'s father, John Henry—perhaps an Anglicisation of Jean Henri?—Borrell (1757–1840), migrated to London's East End in the 1780s, and one of his several sons, Henry Perigal<sup>23</sup> Borrell, was born there, in Clerkenwell, on 24 August 1795. While the boy's first Christian name is self-evidently his father's second (and the one John Henry apparently preferred to use), the origin of 'Perigal' is more a matter of surmise, though plausible enough as such. Perigal is a surname identifiable in clock- and watch-making circles in eighteenth-century London, and indeed in the very firm joined (or so it would appear) by the Borrells, Markwick-Marckham.<sup>24</sup> Thus the likelihood is that John Henry Borrell's wife, Kitty, was either a Perigal or brought that name from her side of the family. In any event, not only H.P. (to use the name-form he seems to have favoured) but his brothers Maximilian<sup>25</sup> and George also entered their father's profession. Markwick-Markham's particular speciality was clocks and watches for the Turkish

<sup>20</sup> For much of what now follows I am indebted to Mr Andrew Meadows of the British Museum, who assembled and sent to me a body of information (and documentation) about Borrell. Further information was kindly provided by Mr Edwin Borrell of Woolwich (H.P. Borrell's great-grandson), and I owe special thanks to his nephew, Mr Dennis Borrell of Milton Keynes, custodian of the family history (and of the portrait-engraving of Borrell that appears here as Pl. II).

<sup>21</sup> This date is unambiguous on the catalogue's title-page, so the discrepancy between it and the *DNB*'s '1851' is at first sight puzzling. However, the Sotheby catalogue mentions only coins, not 'antiquities and gems'. The same auction-house offered Borrell's library in 1853. Note also that parts of Borrell's coin collection were sold during his lifetime—to the Bank of England—in 1826 and 1831 (see W.M. Acres, *The Bank of England from within, 1694–1900* (2 vols, Oxford, 1931), vol. 2, 598; I owe this reference to Andrew Meadows); these coins were loaned by the Bank to the British Museum in 1865 and formally acquired by the Museum in 1877. Ten years later, the first edition of B.V. Head's *Historia numorum* (Oxford, 1887) mentioned a manuscript catalogue of the British Museum's holdings of Borrell's coins.

<sup>22</sup> Whitehead, 'David Ross of Bladensburg' (see note 16 above), 9; for 'others' see, e.g., the *Numismatic Chronicle* reviewer quoted above and Louis Robert, 'Inscriptions grecques de Sidè en Pamphylie', *RPh* (1958), 15–53: 20, note 2 ('résident anglais à Smyrne au milieu du XIXe siècle').

<sup>23</sup> The single-'l' version appears to be the authentic one (*pace MEB* and *IBNH*).

<sup>24</sup> I am no expert in these matters, but I gather that there are watches signed 'Robert Markham. Fra[n]cis Perigal' (down to 1780) and 'Markwick Markham Perigal' (as late as 1825); 'Markwick Markham Borrell' examples (to 1813) are also known.

<sup>25</sup> See above, note 18.

market; their products bore Turkish numerals and were tailored to this market in matters of taste and aesthetics as well. This naturally explains why, in his early twenties, H.P. was dispatched to Smyrna/Izmir. He is buried there too, in the British Cemetery at Bucca, and the—or at least some—Borrells continued to live there for more than a century, surviving the loss of their house and department store in the Turkish invasion of 1922 and returning to England only in the 1940s. Perhaps only a few years after he was sent to Smyrna, H.P. married Amelia Boddington (1805–70), by whom he had ten children. Amelia—known as Emily—was a granddaughter of George Boddington, one of the first governors of the Bank of England; hence, no doubt, Borrell's transactions with that august institution.<sup>26</sup>

Together, then, with what we already knew (such as the Smyrna connections of Arundell and de Cadalvène), there is obviously much matter here that is consistent with H.P. Borrell being our copyist: the general chronology especially, and Borrell's evident fluency in French. More importantly, however, his epigraphic transcriptions are already a matter of record.

#### 4. H.P. Borrell and epigraphy

A few transcriptions by Borrell are cited in *CIG*. The first volume, edited by August Boeckh under the auspices of the Prussian *Akademie der Wissenschaften* in Berlin, appeared in 1828. Its coverage, Athens and the bulk of Balkan Greece, overlaps but little with the contents of our notebook. Borrell's notebook includes just two Athenian inscriptions (25 and 57), only the second of which features in *CIG*, and Boeckh's sources for it are irrelevant for our present purposes (see under 57). However, the second volume of *CIG* (1843) cites Borrell for three items, all of them in the notebook (*CIG* citations in italics):

(i) *CIG*, no. 2811 (from Aphrodisias, in Caria): *Borrellius Smyrna misit Prokeschio* ['Borrell sent [this], from Smyrna, to Prokesch'<sup>27</sup>], *hic Gerhardo, Gerhardus mihi, et duplex quidem exemplum (alterum a. 1831, alterum a. 1832), unde optima delegi.*

What Boeckh prints here is precisely (with the addition only of line numbers) the notebook's 58, outline drawing and all.

(ii) *CIG*, no. 2933 (from Tralles, in Caria/Lydia): *vss. 13 edo ex schedis Borrellii Smyrna ad Prokeschium missis* ['lines 1–3 I edit from Borrell's sheets sent, from Smyrna, to Prokesch'], *ab hoc Romam ad Gerhardum, a Gerhardo ad nos.*

The notebook's 23 does have only the first three (of sixteen) lines.

(iii) *CIG*, no. 2935 (also from Tralles): *ed Arundell Itin VII Eccles in tabulis iuxta n. 20. Habeo etiam ex duplicibus Borrellii schedis* ['I also have [it] from two sheets of Borrell's'], *quarum alteras ea via accepi de qua monui ad n. 2933, alteras a Zellio.*

The apparatus criticus then shows that Boeckh did have a copy corresponding to the notebook's 22.<sup>28</sup>

<sup>26</sup> See above, note 21.

<sup>27</sup> Namely Anton Ritter von Prokesch-Osten (1795–1876), the Austrian author of *Erinnerungen aus Ägypten und Kleinasien* (3 vols, Vienna, 1829–31) and *Denkwürdigkeiten und Erinnerungen aus dem Orient* (3 vols, Stuttgart, 1836–7).

<sup>28</sup> Which differs in certain respects from Arundell's, e.g. ΓΑΙΟΣΛ (Discoveries, ΛΙΟΣΛ) in line 1, ΞΥ|STAPXHΣ (Discoveries, ΠΥ|ΣTAPXHΣ) in lines 9–10.

This degree of proof alone establishes a very strong *prima facie* case for identifying the notebook's owner and user as H.P. Borrell, and he may well be the source—direct or indirect—of other items even when not named as such.<sup>29</sup> The third volume of *CIG* then helps to confirm this identification beyond doubt: edited by Johannes Franz (1804–51) and published in 1853, this volume refers to Borrell not in the main body of entries but in the *Addenda et corrigenda* section (pp 1050ff). This happens first at p. 1105: ‘*N. 3952. p. 43. denuo transcripserunt et ediderunt Bailius Fasc. inscr. II p. 242. usus apographo a Borrellio misso et Lebasius [...]*’ [re-editions by Bailie, ‘on the basis of a copy sent by Borrell’, and Philippe Le Bas]. The inscription concerned, from Attuda in Phrygia, is not in the present notebook, and neither are eleven others likewise cited by Franz as having come to Bailie via Borrell.<sup>30</sup> A further fifteen, however, are.<sup>31</sup>

It is therefore clear that we must transfer our attention, temporarily, from H.P. Borrell to J.K. Bailie.

### 5. James Kennedy Bailie

The work abbreviated by Johannes Franz as *Bailius Fasc. inscr.* in the third volume of *CIG* (p. 1105 and *passim*) was published in London and Dublin in three volumes in the 1840s. Its first volume (1842) was entitled *Fasciculus inscriptionum Graecarum quae apud sedes apocalypticis chartis mandatas, et nunc denuo instauratas, praeftationibusque et notis instructas edidit Jacobus Kennedy Bailie, S.T.P.* (‘A small bundle of Greek inscriptions which, committed to paper at Apocalyptic sites and now freshly restored, equipped with introductions and notes, James Kennedy Bailie, S.T.P.,<sup>32</sup> has edited’), and it duly restricted itself to editions, with introduction and commentary, of 41 Greek inscriptions from western Asia Minor (Ephesus, Smyrna, Pergamum, etc.). The second (1846) and third (1849) volumes, however, were both larger—220 and 178 documents respectively—and more eclectic. Greek still predominates, but (under the modified title of *Fasciculus inscriptionum, Graecarum potissimum [...]*, i.e., ‘mainly Greek’ inscriptions) Latin and, briefly, Lycian also feature. The editor presented himself to the world, on his title pages, in the following grandiloquent terms: *presbyt. dioecis. Armachens.; nobiliss. Marchioni de Ailsa a sacr. domest.; Acad. Reg. Hibern., societt. Reg. zoolog., geolog., archaeolog. Hibern., consociat. Britann. in progress. scient., ex sodall.; quondam collegii SS. Trinit. Dublinens. socius, et ibidem de litt. graec. praelector* [‘Priest of the diocese of Armagh;

<sup>29</sup>See, for example, *CIG*, no. 2359*b*, reproduced as the *alterum exemplar* in *IG XII.5*, no. 527*B*. Boeckh noted that Prokesch's copy sent to him by Zell was apparently not made by Prokesch himself. It corresponds exactly to the notebook's 52.

<sup>30</sup>See *CIG*, nos 4342*b Add.*, 4342*d Add.*, 4342*d2*, 4342*d3*, 4373*b*, 4432*f*, 4432*h*, 4436*Add.*, 4436*b*, 4528*Add.* and 4528*d*. (*CIG* nos followed by *Add.* here and in note 31 refer to inscriptions in the main body of *CIG*, vol. 3, that have Bailie–Borrell versions in the *Addenda*; nos without *Add.* refer to documents mentioned *only* in the *Addenda*.)

<sup>31</sup>See *CIG*, nos 3969*Add.* (92), 4275*Add.* (171), 4300*k* (179), 4302*a* (196), 4322*Add.* (132), 4340*b* (211), 4340*c* (101), 4340*d* (206), 4340*e* (210), 4340*f* (105), 4340*g* (106), 4341*Add.* (103), 4346*Add.* (212), 4424*Add.* (131) and 4428*Add.* (100).

<sup>32</sup>Prof. Brian Scott kindly informs me that these letters stand for *Sacrae Theologiae Praeceptor*. It is apparently not a specific degree in theology but a more general kind of (self-awarded?) honorific appellation.

domestic chaplain to His Lordship the Marquess of Ailsa;<sup>33</sup> Member of the Royal Irish Academy, the Royal Irish Zoological, Geological and Archaeological Societies, the British Association for the Advancement of Science; sometime Fellow of Trinity College, Dublin, and Lecturer in Greek there’].

To these facts others can be added for a fuller picture.<sup>34</sup> ‘Jacobus Kennedy Bailie’ (1793–1864) was born plain James Kennedy, the son of the Revd Nicholas Ward Kennedy; his adoption—under the will of a deceased uncle—of the extra surname Bailie did not occur until he was in his early forties.<sup>35</sup> By that time he had a string of qualifications (BA, MA, BD, DD) from Trinity College Dublin, of which he had become a Junior Fellow in 1817. In that same year he was ordained deacon in the Church of Ireland; his election to Ordinary Membership of the Royal Irish Academy came the following year (26 January 1818). His RIA obituarist describes him as ‘distinguished as a Greek scholar’ and cites in support of this claim Bailie’s production of ‘two different editions of the Iliad of Homer, one with Latin notes and excursus in 1821–3; the other with English notes, for school and college use, in 1833. He was also the author of ‘[Ten] Lectures on the Philosophy of the Mosaic Record of the Creation’, published in 1826 [actually 1827]; and of ‘Prelections on the Language and Literature of Ancient Greece’, published in 1834’. To these we can add an edition (1829) of Aeschylus’ *Agamemnon* ‘from the corrected edition of Blomfield’. From 1830 onwards he combined his lectureship in Greek at Trinity with the role of rector of the parish of Ardtrea, County Tyrone, which had acquired an expensive and elegant new parish church at precisely this time. Besides his work on inscriptions, to which we must return below, he composed and published *Lachrymae academicae: comprising stanzas in English and Greek, addressed to the memory of the Princess Charlotte* (1818) and *A poem on the restoration of Armagh cathedral*. A younger brother, also a cleric but shorter-lived, was, on the face of it, fraternally unluckier; Leslie’s *Supplement to Armagh clergy and parishes* records an anecdote to the effect that ‘when [Bailie] was asked to help his brother, Revd. R.R. Kennedy [1803–49], Perpetual Curate of Woods [Chapel, a

<sup>33</sup>This in the 1842 and 1846 volumes only. It is evident from *Debrett’s peerage, baronetage, knighthood and companionship* (London, 1990 edn) that the Marquess in question was Archibald, 12th Earl of Cassilis, for whom the title was created in 1831; he died in 1846. The family name is Kennedy (among its present members is the writer and broadcaster Sir Ludovic); I have not discovered a substantive connection with the Marquess, but Bailie apparently claimed one—see note 37 below.

<sup>34</sup>Sources: Samuel Lewis, *A topographical dictionary of Ireland* (2nd edn, 2 vols, London, 1847), for a few background details; W.B.S. Taylor, *History of the University of Dublin* (Dublin, 1845), 497; *ME[sic]B*, vol. 2 (1897), col. 202; Bailie’s obituary in *PRIA* 8 (1861–4), 485 (part of the report of the Secretary of the Council, J.K. Ingram, read 16 March 1864); J.B. Leslie, *Armagh clergy and parishes* (Dundalk, 1911) and the *Supplement* to it (Dundalk, 1948). See next note for further references.

<sup>35</sup>The June 1833 statistical report, by Lieut. Charles Bailey, to the Irish Ordnance Survey (quoted in *OSMI*, vol. 20, *Parishes of County Tyrone II, 1825, 1833–5, 1840: Mid and East Tyrone* (1993), 8) names the then rector of Ardtrea (see below) as—still—‘Dr Kennedy’; the actual date of his change of name is documented in R.J. Hayes, *Manuscript sources for the history of Irish civilisation* (11 vols, Boston, Mass., 1965), vol. 1, *Persons A–D*, 108: ‘Baillie (Rev. James Kennedy). Genealogical Office Ms. 107, pp. 101–2, Copy of grant of arms being Baillie quartering Kennedy, to the Rev. James Kennedy D.D., Rector of Ardtrea, Co. Armagh on his assuming under Royal Licence and in compliance with the wishes of his late uncle, The Rev. Thomas Kennedy Baillie the name and arms of Baillie, March 23, 1836.’ (The ‘1835’ in *MEB* is therefore incorrect.) An identical entry appears, immediately below, under Baillie (Rev. Thomas Kennedy). The uncle had died in 1818, so his nephew’s ‘compliance’ was tardy, to say the least.

living in the patronage of the Rector], who was ill, he refused, saying he was his brother “only by the accident of birth” (p. 39).

The position of Rector of Ardtrea, it may be noted, was in the gift of the Provost and Fellows of Trinity, and in going there Bailie was successor-but-one to a figure of far greater note, the Orientalist Edward Hincks (1792–1866; rector at Ardtrea 1819–26 before moving to Killyleagh, County Down).<sup>36</sup>

This then was the man—learned, narcissistic and unpleasant<sup>37</sup>—whose epigraphic editions, some of them involving copies made by H.P. Borrell, found their way into the addenda of the third volume of *CIG*. The instances where Bailie *acknowledged* such copies, however, are only the tips of a larger and more complicatedly contoured iceberg.

## 6. Bailie and Borrell

Bailie's first volume of inscriptions (*Fasciculus*, vol. 1 (1842)) contains no material explicitly said to have come from Borrell, but it does include versions of three of the notebook's texts (9, 78, 83). For no. 15 (9) an addendum in the second volume (1846) records that Bailie has received ‘a copy very carefully made by Borrell’ (*a Borrellio apographum cura haud mediocri confectum*) (p. 176–7).<sup>38</sup> Neither no. 28 (83) nor no. 34 (78) mentions Borrell, even in retrospect, although in the latter case LW, at no. 30, printing exactly what is in both the notebook and Bailie, present it as *communiquée par feu Borrell* (‘notified by the late Borrell’). If, in other words, we include the addendum to no. 15 (9) it can be said that the inscriptions in the first volume of *Fasciculus* comprise four categories of material: (A) not in our notebook and otherwise unconnectable with Borrell; (B) in the notebook but *prima facie* unconnectable with a copy by Borrell; (C) in the notebook and acknowledged to come from a copy by Borrell; and (D) in the notebook and deducible as coming from a copy by Borrell.<sup>39</sup> Category A—the irrelevant one for our purposes here—is much the largest, at 38 items, while categories B–D are represented by one document apiece.

The second and third (1849) volumes of *Fasciculus* continue to furnish these four categories, but they also generate two more: (E) not in the notebook but acknowledged to come from a copy by Borrell; and (F) not in the notebook but

<sup>36</sup>As is clear from their dates of birth, Hincks and (as he then was) Kennedy were almost exact contemporaries, and each won a Trinity scholarship in 1810; Hincks, however, was the first to become a Fellow (in 1813). The paragraph on Hincks in Taylor's *History of the University of Dublin* (see note 34), pp 497–8, claims that ‘he has published Classical and Antiquarian Researches, in conjunction with Dr James Kennedy’, but I have been unable to find any such thing. On Hincks, see generally E.F. Davidson, *Edward Hincks: a selection from his correspondence, with a memoir* (Oxford, 1933).

<sup>37</sup>These are my own adjectives, but I notice that they echo at least one voice from the nineteenth century. Sir Sidney Lee's entry on Bailie in *DNB* cites not only published materials but ‘information kindly supplied by the Rev Dr Stubbs of Trinity College Dublin’ (i.e. the mathematician John William Stubbs (1821–97), Senior Fellow of Trinity from 1882), and it must be this that underlies the following: ‘In manner [Bailie] was vain and pompous, and he is said to have claimed relationship with the Marquis of Ailsa, which the latter declined to admit, although Kennedy offered to make him his heir [!] on condition that the relationship was acknowledged.’ (*DNB*, vol. 30 (1892), 422–3: 423).

<sup>38</sup>The reading ΣΑΜΒΙΘΕΙΩΙ in line 2, attributed to Borrell, is the one in the notebook.

<sup>39</sup>I base this deduction, as a rule, on LW stating that their copy of the respective inscription in *Fasciculus* is from Borrell and it being the same as the notebook copy.

deducible as coming from a copy by Borrell.<sup>40</sup> The breakdown of inscriptions per category in the second and third volumes is as follows: vol. 2 (220 inscriptions in total)—A 85;<sup>41</sup> B 7;<sup>42</sup> C 39;<sup>43</sup> D 21;<sup>44</sup> E 45;<sup>45</sup> F 23;<sup>46</sup> vol. 3 (178 inscriptions in total)—A 118;<sup>47</sup> B 2;<sup>48</sup> C 5;<sup>49</sup> D 46;<sup>50</sup> E 5;<sup>51</sup> F 2.<sup>52</sup>

Two straightforward facts flow immediately from these figures, even before a closer examination of what lies behind them. Firstly and most simply, the Borrell/Bailie overlap is far from complete. Just as the notebook includes sites (and consequently documents) not to be found in *Fasciculus* (Bailie did not, for example, deal with the Aegean islands), so all three volumes of *Fasciculus* proffer many category-A items that have no bearing on the present enquiry. (The third volume, in particular, passes largely out of Borrell's orbit once the focus becomes Syria and Egypt; even so, see nos 332, 347, 348, and especially 359*a* = 66.) Secondly, the existence and extent of categories E and F make it self-evident that Borrell copied more documents (and supplied his copies to Bailie and/or LW) than are to be found in the present notebook.

Against this background, the material that demands our attention is that of categories B–D, which the notebook and Bailie have in common.

### 7. Bailie, Borrell and W.H. Waddington

Bailie makes a general (and ostensibly generous) acknowledgment to Borrell in the preface to the second volume (1846) of *Fasciculus*, written in July 1845:

*In hac parte operis plurimum me debere apographis profiteor quae humanissime mecum communicavit Henricus P. Borrellius, e negotiatoribus Anglis apud Smyrnenses, ipse antiquitatis quae ad rem numismaticam spectat instar omnium peritus, et Graecarum litterarum amantissimus. Museo hujus viri eximii plurima insunt monumenta ex diversis sedibus Asiae Smyrnam advecta quorum permulta titulos habent insculptos, quaedam anaglypha varie ornata. Libellos potissima horum complexos manuque propria descriptos nuper mihi, ut ingenium meum et (quatenus valeat) doctrinam in iis concinnandis colloquem, transmissos habeo.*

(In this part of my work [namely, Cilicia, Pisidia, Pamphylia] I confess that I owe most to copies which Henry P. Borrell—one of the English

<sup>40</sup> See note 39.

<sup>41</sup> Nos 44, 46, 47, 50–68, 70–85, 94, 102, 103, 104, 108–10, 134–7, 155, 156, 164–6, 169, 170, 178–82, 184, 185, 188, 189, 191–7, 201–5, 242, 243, 248, 252, 254, 256–8.

<sup>42</sup> Nos 106, 112, 160, 161, 244, 247, 255.

<sup>43</sup> Nos 43, 48, 89, 90, 93, (95), 97, (101), 107, 111, 113, 114, 128, 129, 132, 139–41, 143, 144, 149, 150, 152, 158, 159, 167, 186, 219–22, 225–8, 233, 236, 237, (246).

<sup>44</sup> Nos 42, 91, 130, 131, 138, 142, 146, 148, 153, 190, 216–18, 223, 224, 235, 239–41, 245, 249.

<sup>45</sup> Nos 45, 49, 69, 86, 92, 96, 98–100, 105, 115, 120, 123–5, 127, 133, 147, 151, 157, 162, 163, 168, 171–7, 183, 187, 198–200, 206–11, 230, 234, 238, 253.

<sup>46</sup> Nos 87, 88, 116–19, 121, 122, 126, 145, 154, (212), 213–15, 229, 231, 232, 250, 251, 259–61.

<sup>47</sup> Nos 264, 265, 288, 306–8, 310, 325–31, 333–46, 349–58*b*, 359*b*–421.

<sup>48</sup> Nos 266 and 289.

<sup>49</sup> Nos 271, 294, 295, 319, 359*a*.

<sup>50</sup> Nos 267–70, 272–87, 291–3, 296–8, 300–5, 309, 311–18, 320–24.

<sup>51</sup> Nos 262, 263, 332, 347, 348.

<sup>52</sup> Nos 290 and 299.

businessmen at Smyrna, himself as good as anyone in numismatic expertise, and a great lover of Greek letters—has very kindly communicated to me. In the private collection of this outstanding man are most monuments, brought to Smyrna from various sites of Asia, of which very many have inscriptions, and some sculpted reliefs of different kinds. I possess notebooks, recently sent to me, containing the most important of these, described in [his] own hand, in order that I might employ my ability and (for what it may be worth) learning in arranging them.) (*Fasciculus*, vol. 2, 3.)

Further on in the Preface, in anticipatory comments on his no. 234 (not in the notebook), Bailie mentions ‘copies, which Borrell very kindly put in my hands, made by those most excellent men Jens Pell and D. Ross of Bladensburg’ (*apographis [...] quae mihi humanissime in manus tradiderat Borrellius a viris ornatissimis Jens. Pellio et D. Rossio de Bladensburg confecta*) (*Fasciculus*, vol. 2, 7).

This terminology is less than pellucid, but Bailie seems to be saying that Borrell’s material reached him in the form of actual notebooks (*libelli*), not merely individual sheets. That one of the notebooks themselves contained the copies by Pell and Ross mentioned might further be assumed but is not self-evident.

In any case, something of a paradox arises here. Had no more than this general acknowledgement been made, users of the second volume of *Fasciculus* would probably have assumed that Bailie’s reliance on Borrell was considerable and thought no more of the matter. But in reality, as we have seen, Borrell turns out to be specifically acknowledged for certain items (my category C) and not others. In the case of those others, this obviously predisposes the reader to assume that no copy by Borrell is involved. (Furthermore, even when such a copy is acknowledged Bailie often claims that he has used it in addition to one of his own.<sup>53</sup>) As regards the third volume, there is no mention of Borrell in the preface; he is simply acknowledged for the handful of category-C and category-E items listed above.

Suspicions that Bailie was using Borrell far more than he chose to admit and (for this and other reasons) a low opinion of his *modus operandi* are nothing new; they were voiced more than once by W.H. Waddington in LW. His main outburst comes at no. 1300 (193):

Depuis que j’ai entre les mains les copies d’inscriptions faites par M. Ross de Bladensburg, et communiquées à Le Bas par Borrell, j’ai acquis la conviction qu’une portion considérable des inscriptions publiées par Bailie, et notamment celles de Lycie, ont été données d’après le manuscrit de Ross, corrigé et amendé par Bailie, et non d’après des copies faites par Bailie lui-même; et que par conséquent les textes de Bailie n’ont aucune valeur pour la critique (voyez nos. 1255, 1263, 1276, 1303, 1309, 1311, 1315, etc.). Je reconnais que les corrections faites par Bailie sont souvent justes; mais elles sont précisément du genre de celles que tout épigraphiste peut faire en comparant ensemble des inscriptions similaires; quand il y a

<sup>53</sup> For this see, e.g., *Fasciculus*, vol. 2, no. 45: *Descripti de lapide supra cameram fornicatam in regione amphitheatri. Habeo et apographum mihi a Borrellio missum* (‘I transcribed [this] from a stone above an arched roof near the amphitheatre. I also have a copy sent to me by Borrell’).

une difficulté, que Bailie n'a pu résoudre, son texte ne diffère plus de celui de Ross (voyez au no. 1292); quelquefois il l'a modifié, uniquement parce qu'il ne le comprenait pas (nos. 1307, 1308, 1316). D'ailleurs les notes sur la provenance ou la position des monuments, qui se trouvent dans le manuscrit de Ross, sont reproduites par Bailie souvent mot pour mot; et il me semble impossible qu'il ne les ait pas eues sous les yeux. Le procédé suivi par Bailie n'aurait pas grand inconvénient, s'il s'en était expliqué nettement et s'il avait donné les variantes de la copie à côté des ses propres conjectures; malheureusement, il n'en est pas ainsi, et cette circonstance ôte à son ouvrage une grande partie de sa valeur. J'ai déjà cité [under no. 1276] ses propres paroles: *Lectores commonefactos velim quod inscriptiones ab omni fere parte expurgatae accedunt, non quales inter describendum exaravi* [vol. 1, p. 10]. J'ajouterai que lorsqu'il n'a pas copié une inscription lui-même, il se sert généralement de l'expression: *descriptum habui*.<sup>54</sup>

This exasperation surfaces again at no. 1311 (196):

[I]l est évident pour moi que le texte de Bailie n'est que celui de Ross, arbitrairement corrigé et remanié, et je doute fort que Bailie ait jamais été en Lycie. L'extrême légèreté, pour ne pas dire plus, avec laquelle Bailie s'est permis de publier des textes en partie imaginaires, est d'autant plus regrettable, qu'ils ont été acceptés sans défiance par Franz et qu'ils forment une notable portion des *Addenda* du troisième volume du *Corpus inscriptionum Graecarum*.<sup>55</sup>

<sup>54</sup>As soon as I had in my hands the copies of inscriptions made by Mr Ross of Bladensburg and sent to Le Bas by Borrell, I became convinced that a considerable number of the inscriptions published by Bailie, particularly those of Lycia, had been taken from Ross's manuscript, corrected and improved by Bailie, rather than from copies made by Bailie himself; and that, consequently, Bailie's texts had no critical value (see nos 1255 [157], 1263 [165], 1276 [177], 1303 [185], 1309 [181], 1311 [196], 1315 [197], etc.). True, the corrections made by Bailie are often justifiable, but they are of precisely the sort that any epigraphist could make by comparing a body of similar inscriptions; when there is a problem that Bailie could not solve, his text is no different from Ross's (see at no. 1292 [180]); sometimes he has altered it, but invariably because he did not understand it (nos 1307 [182], 1308 [191], 1316 [195]). What is more, the notes on the provenance or the position of monuments that occur in Ross's manuscript are often reproduced word for word by Bailie; to me it seems impossible that he had seen them for himself. The procedure followed by Bailie would not have caused great inconvenience if he had explained it clearly and if he had juxtaposed the copy's variants with his own conjectures; unfortunately he did not do so, and that fact robs his work of much of its value. I have already cited [under 1276 (177)] his own words: "I wish readers to remember that inscriptions are presented not as they were seen and copied but, in almost every respect, expurgated" [vol. 1, p. 10]. I might add that when he has not copied an inscription himself he generally employs the expression "I have [this] described".

<sup>55</sup>[T]o me it is obvious that Bailie's text is nothing but Ross's, arbitrarily corrected and recast, and I seriously doubt whether Bailie ever went to Lycia. The extreme frivolity, to put it no more strongly, with which Bailie allowed himself to publish semi-imaginary texts is all the more regrettable because they have been accepted without suspicion by Franz and make up a considerable bulk of the *Addenda* in the third volume of the *CIG*. On Waddington (1826–94), scion of an English family long settled in France, see generally J.E. Sandys, *A history of classical scholarship* (see note 9 above), vol. 3, 267–9. Waddington's suspicions about Bailie were briefly noted, but not followed up, by Louis Robert (*RPh* 1958, 15–53: 20, note 2 (see note 22 above); *Gnomon* 31 (1959), 1–30: 9, note 5).



Leaving aside for the moment the issue of what Bailie did with his texts and sticking to that of his sources for them, Borrell's notebook enables us not merely to endorse these suspicions<sup>56</sup> but to enlarge them. The disingenuous *descriptum habui* formula or some variant thereof is applied by Bailie to all nine of the category-B documents (transcripts in the notebook that neither Bailie nor anyone else, to my knowledge, has hitherto connected with Borrell) in the second and third volumes of *Fasciculus*: thus no. 106 (86), from Mylasa; no. 112 (23), from Tralles; nos 160 (3) and 161 (2), from Teos; no. 244 (89), from Prymnessos; no. 247 (90), from Sebaste; no. 255 (84), from Nikomedia; no. 266 (39), from Antiphellos; and no. 289 (198), from Limyra. All these texts, I believe, came to Bailie from Borrell—as we know others from these places did;<sup>57</sup> and in doing so they assisted the dissembling Bailie in his pretence that he had personally visited all the major ancient sites of the eastern Mediterranean and personally copied all the inscriptions he saw there.

A clearer idea (though still artfully opaque) than anything conveyed in *Fasciculus* of where Bailie did go and what documents he did see and copy can be derived from his 'Memoir of researches amongst the inscribed monuments of the Graeco-Roman era, in certain ancient sites of Asia Minor', read in May 1842 and June 1843 to the Royal Irish Academy.<sup>58</sup>

Sifting out the hard facts from the florid verbosity, we learn first and foremost that the archbishop of Armagh granted Bailie leave of absence from his duties at Ardtrea for six months—later extended to a year—in order to undertake antiquarian travel in Asia Minor and that this year began, for practical purposes, with his arrival at Ephesus on 8 September 1840.<sup>59</sup> Incidental mention is made of visits to Delphi, Athens and the Peloponnese;<sup>60</sup> these, it seems reasonable to assume, took place en route to the Turkish coast, and they appear to have involved no copying of documents.

Once in Turkey his itinerary proper began, but its description is very confusing. A first version goes thus: Ephesus, Geyerah (Aphrodisias), Ailah Shehir (Philadelphia), Sart (Sardis), Kîrkagatch (between Thyateira and Pergamum), Ak-Hissâr (Thyateira), Pergamum, Eski-Stanpûl (Alexandria Troas), Beëram (Assos), the Troad generally, Smyrna, 'the churches of the Apocalypse' and the Dardanelles.<sup>61</sup> A later list of sites comprises Tralles, Nysa, Antioch, Aphrodisias (again)

<sup>56</sup> See for example 165. LW, at no. 1263, introduce it (as a Ross-de-Bladensburg copy via Borrell) as follows: 'Dans le mur d'une maison, fruste et mutilée; à côté il y a un bas-relief dégradé par le feu'; the notebook as: 'Another in a wall of a house being mutilated—here also a bas-relief much injured by fire'; Bailie (at his no. 323) says the same, with a characteristically self-aggrandising twist: the fire damage was such that he had 'more than once despaired of extracting any sense' from the document ('*Descripta habui de fragmine loculi sepulchralis in parietem domus Turcicae indidem inmisso. Eminebat supra ornatus sculptilis exstans, quem vero cum tituli ipsius litteris ignis aliquando admotus adeo absumpserat ut de sensu extricando plus semel desperaverim*').

<sup>57</sup> For example, no. 106 should be associated with nos 105 and 107 (11); no. 112 with nos 111 (22) and 113 (61); nos 160–1 with nos 157, 158 (67) and 159 (1); nos 244 with no. 245 (63); no. 247 with no. 246 (32); and no. 266 with no. 271 (179) and others. Nos 255 and 289 lack any such contextual association.

<sup>58</sup> *TRIA* 19 (1838–43), Polite Literature, 111–58 (summarised in *PRIA* 2 (1840–4), 253–6)—hereafter cited as 'Memoir I'; resumed in *TRIA* 21 (1839–48), Polite Literature, 11–86 (summarised in *PRIA* 2 (1840–4), 407–10)—hereafter cited as 'Memoir II'.

<sup>59</sup> 'Memoir I', 121–2.

<sup>60</sup> 'Memoir I', 113, 115 and 116 respectively.

<sup>61</sup> 'Memoir I', 116–17.

and Karoura.<sup>62</sup> One might have been inclined to slot these sites into the first part of the longer list above were it not for the fact that a significantly different version of the whole—save for the final section north of Pergamum—is subsequently proffered: Smyrna, Teos, Ephesus, Tralles, Nysa, Antioch, Aphrodisias, back to Antioch, Karoura, Laodiceia, Hierapolis, Philadelphia, Sardis, Thyateira, Nakrasa, Pergamum, back to Smyrna.<sup>63</sup>

No elucidation is forthcoming from a comparison of these purported journeys with the order of the sites represented in the first and second volumes of *Fasciculus*. However, one or two points, thankfully, are not obfuscated. In particular, W.H. Waddington's suspicion (quoted in note 55 above) that Bailie did not go as far south as Lycia is borne out by the latter's own admission.<sup>64</sup>

Where, then, did he go? The first volume of *Fasciculus* presents material from Ephesus (three documents), Philadelphia (four), Sardis (two), Thyateira (nine), Pergamum (seven), Smyrna (nine), 'Kirkagadj' (= Germe: three), Konyaion (two), Azanoi (one), and Kadoi (one). These last three sites, all in Phrygia, are not mentioned in the 'Memoir', and they look very much like makeweights for the volume, tucked in at the end where nobody would pay them much attention. Otherwise, genuine visits to these sites and actual autopsy, as claimed,<sup>65</sup> of all of these documents (described more fully in 'Memoir I') need not be questioned. Incidentally, a brief allusion is made in 'Memoir I' to 'a gentleman of Smyrna, who most kindly attended me through the city'.<sup>66</sup> One naturally wonders whether this was Borrell, though reasons for a different identification come to light in 'Memoir II' (see below).

It is when we turn to the second and especially to the third volume of *Fasciculus*—both of which are much larger than the first—that we find Bailie eking out ever more sparingly the fruits of his sabbatical year and relying instead on copies (and even printed texts?) produced by others, including Borrell.

The second volume begins with two documents from Hadrianopolis in Bithynia. One of them (no. 43 = 29) is said to have come from Borrell, the other (no. 42 = 26) probably did too; in any event, there is no reason to think that Bailie ever went there. Next comes a run of 42 documents from Aphrodisias, despite the fact that in 'Memoir II' ('Teos and Aphrodisias') Bailie claims to have collected only 'some fifteen or twenty' there and describes fewer than ten individually. The inscriptions from Teos tell the same story on a smaller scale: there are eight documents from there in *Fasciculus*, vol. 2 (nos 154–61), but Bailie claims in 'Memoir II' to have 'collected' only five, and only three are described individually. Then there is more material from Smyrna (nos 140–53), most of it expressly credited to Borrell and *all* of it possible to link with him.<sup>67</sup> Again we wonder whether he met Borrell there. Nothing is said of this in the body of 'Memoir II'.

<sup>62</sup> 'Memoir I', 122.

<sup>63</sup> 'Memoir II', 16.

<sup>64</sup> 'Memoir II', 16.

<sup>65</sup> 'I have reported [in this 'Memoir'] no documents [...] which have not been copied either by myself, or under my immediate superintendence, from the original monuments' ('Memoir I', 154).

<sup>66</sup> 'Memoir I', 121; cf. 'Memoir I', 155, 'a gentleman resident in Smyrna'.

<sup>67</sup> In this context one cannot help relishing the comment about no. 147 (not in the notebook, but see LW, no. 20): *Editum reperio inter Böckhiana [CIG, no. 3324] ex schedis Prokeschii, quae, opinor, magnam partem confecta sunt ex Borrellianis* ['I see that this is in Boeckh's collection, edited from sheets of Prokesch that, in my opinion, have been largely produced from Borrell's'].

Instead, the writer's gratitude is expressed to two individuals: his old friend (and 'College acquaintance') Revd W.B. Lewis, 'the British Chaplain at Smyrna', and the 'intelligent traveller [...] Thomas Rothwell, Esq., who was a resident in the neighbourhood of Smyrna during my visit'.<sup>68</sup> Rothwell is thanked for his courtesy and help in Smyrna itself and because he 'most kindly placed at my disposal the contents of a diary which he had kept during an excursion which he made to the site of Teos and [...] during visits to] Philadelphia, Sardes, and Thyatira'.<sup>69</sup> Bailie, as I have said, makes no mention of Borrell here, but makes some amends for this in the 'Postscript' ('Memoir II', pp 66–86) of addenda to both parts of the 'Memoir'. There, in an addendum to *Fasciculus*, vol. 1, no. 1, he proposes a textual alteration 'on the authority of a copy which has been recently transmitted to me by my friend H.P. Borrell Esq., of Smyrna, a gentleman so well known to the antiquarian public as an accomplished numismatist'.<sup>70</sup> The particular value of these words is in the proof they furnish that Borrell had begun sending material to Bailie no later than 1843.

The vast majority of additional sites represented in the third volume of *Fasciculus* are not places that Bailie ever claims (in 'Memoir I' or 'Memoir II') to have visited. They include Branchidai, Knidos, Halikarnassos, Mylasa, Kelenderis, Korykos, Pompeiopolis, Selinus, Meidani (Seleukeia), Klazomenai, Aspendos, Ataliala, Perge, Side, Apamea, Apollonia, Eumenia, Prymnessos, Sebaste and Derbe. All this material was thus second-hand at best. The only exception arises with the section (nos 186–207) on the Troad, which Bailie claimed to have visited (see note 61 above); so here, evidently, we revert to the mixture of borrowings (including from Borrell, acknowledged and unacknowledged) and autopsy.

The third volume passes rapidly from Galatia (with two out of four documents credited to Borrell) to Lycia—a region, as we have seen, that Bailie confessed to never having visited at all (see note 64 above). Most of its run of Lycian documents (nos 266–324) are in Borrell's notebook. The focus then moves to Syria, Phoenicia and, finally, Egypt. Even in these far-flung parts copies by Borrell were sometimes to be had (see nos 332, 347 and 348), in one instance the stone itself (no. 359 a = 66); but nothing at all is presented in this volume in a way that presupposes Bailie's having seen the original sites.

At this juncture it is appropriate to recall W.H. Waddington's strictures on Bailie. These, as we have seen, were by no means confined to what Bailie had or had not seen for himself. The larger problem was what he had done with the inscriptions; the heaviness (or otherwise) of his editorial hand between the original text and his printed version. For epigraphists actually to see the stones they are working on is not always possible—and indeed not always necessary, provided they have at their disposal the results of autopsy by someone else: photographs, drawings, measurements, verbal descriptions, etc. Nowadays our requirements in these areas are very much more stringent than those that obtained in the second quarter of the nineteenth century, so it would be unfair to condemn Bailie for falling short of standards not set until after his time. His fault

<sup>68</sup>'Memoir II', 17.

<sup>69</sup>'Memoir II', 17; for a link between Rothwell and Borrell, see the Appendix to the present article, under 1 and 2.

<sup>70</sup>'Memoir II', 66; cf. 'Memoir II', 70 (addendum to *Fasciculus*, vol. 1, no. 15), 'a copy which has been forwarded to me by Mr Borrell'.

lies, rather, in arrogantly spurning aims and methods well established and understood even in his time.

Chief amongst these principles, then as now, was a clearcut distinction between what should be copied from a stone and what could subsequently be made of it. Bailie's published texts blur this distinction horribly—and deliberately. A passage in his first paper to the Royal Irish Academy, sarcastically critical of another traveller, is all too revealing in this regard:

[A]vowedly unacquainted with Greek literature himself, [Fellows] adopted the plan of what may be termed mechanical copying; in which way two or three sheets of the soft Turkish paper will perform in a few minutes as much work as would cost ordinary drudges, who have the misfortune to know something of the language, as many hours to get through. Any one, however, who has seen his first volume, will clearly appreciate the advantages of this method [i.e. that all marks on the stone are indiscriminately reproduced] [...]. Rejecting, therefore, all such contrivances for facilitating or expediting labour, my uniform method was, to make myself acquainted, in each instance which presented itself, with the import of the words, when it was at all possible for me to do so. This, after some practice, was of great utility in enabling me to abridge the trouble of a repeated inspection, as established formulae were of constant recurrence, and the known succession of words thus at once suggested itself to the mind [...] [T]he same law of sequence which enabled me without actual inspection to anticipate sentences, supplied me also with the means of restoring them whole when broken off or effaced.<sup>71</sup>

And further on in the same paper, Bailie writes:

I remained [at Aphrodisias] for three days, during which interval I copied a considerable number of inscriptions in different quarters of the ancient site. The labour and difficulty of this operation was much enhanced by the extreme heat of the season, and my disinclination to adopt any mechanical device for curtailing either.<sup>72</sup>

What Bailie parades here as a virtue, with such odious mock humility, was actually a vice, and doubly so. His condescending description of the methods employed by the redoubtable traveller and archaeologist Sir Charles Fellows (1799–1860) represents a stiff-necked failure to grasp the importance of paper 'squeezes' as a means of reproducing each and every mark on a stone's inscribed surface.<sup>73</sup> In any case, Bailie's description of his own approach, in which perusing the actual stone means little or nothing and formulaically recreating its words everything, could hardly be bettered as an object-lesson in how *not* to set about serious epigraphical editing.

<sup>71</sup> 'Memoir I', 117–18.

<sup>72</sup> 'Memoir I', 127.

<sup>73</sup> On squeezes, see generally A.G. Woodhead, *The Study of Greek inscriptions* (2nd edn, Cambridge, 1981), 77–83, and 96, note 2, on some nineteenth-century and earlier pioneers of the technique, including Waddington's senior colleague Philippe Le Bas (1794–1860).

### 8. Bailie, Dethier and the notebook

We have seen, from the 'Postscript' to Bailie's 'Memoir' to the Royal Irish Academy, that Borrell was sending him copies of inscriptions as early as 1843, and we have noted what Bailie then says, in the preface to the second volume of his *Fasciculus*, about having received from Borrell (a) 'notebooks' (*libelli*) containing epigraphical transcripts by Borrell himself and (b) 'copies' (*apographa*), via Borrell, made by others. The relationship between (a) and (b) is left obscure, as is the precise nature of the items in (a)—namely, whether they were copies of originals that Borrell retained or the originals themselves; and with that basic question unanswerable we are left in doubt as to whether the notebook under consideration here is one of the ones that Bailie meant. It is my belief, however, that the generous H.P. Borrell had, by the time the third volume of *Fasciculus* was published in 1849, sent Bailie the present notebook. Bailie, in short, is my candidate for the 'classical scholar of very considerable erudition' (see section 1 above) who acquired and annotated this notebook of Borrell's; and if this did happen before Borrell's death in 1851 it can only, surely, have happened at Borrell's volition. He did not realise, one supposes, that within three or four years he would be dead, so we may well be talking of a loan, not a gift.

Any surprise on our part that Borrell should even temporarily have entrusted to someone else an epigraphic notebook that he had so carefully filled, with his own material and that of others, should be tempered by the fact that he had done this once before, in the early 1830s. Items 88–94 (= pp 88–98) and the two items on the missing p. 104 were copied into the notebook not by Borrell himself but by Anton Dethier.<sup>74</sup>

All this material, save for the two missing items, is in the second volume of *Fasciculus*. In the case of no. 244 (89) a copy by Dethier is acknowledged so fully, indeed, that what Bailie had in front of him must have been something very close to the notebook's p. 90 with its pair of copies by Baron Wolff (via Dethier) and Kiriakos Phaidros. Nos 153 (88), 235 (93), 236 (92), 237 (91) and 249 (94) are more instances of the tell-tale *descriptum habui*, although copies by Dethier via Borrell are mentioned in connection with nos 236–7 (and no. 246 = 32). At no. 247 (90) Bailie cites Dethier again, for the purposes of disputing his and Francis Arundell's views on the find-spot, and in so doing quotes exactly what Dethier says in the notebook (see note 17 above).

My claim, however, is that before the publication of the third volume of *Fasciculus*—and presumably, indeed, before he wrote and dated (27 December 1846) its preface—Bailie had on his desk not merely copies of what was in the notebook but the notebook itself. Evidence in support of this comes from what he himself wrote in it once it was in his possession.

It is simple enough to show that the commentary material added to the notebook (denoted by 'C' in the Appendix below) is very similar indeed to the corresponding material in *Fasciculus*. Three examples will suffice (the underlining of verbatim commentary in example (i) is mine):

<sup>74</sup>To the case for this already presented in note 17 above, a further consideration may now be added. Although there is no extrinsic evidence of a link between Borrell and Dethier, all other relevant links are attested: Arundell–Dethier, Arundell–Kiriakos, Borrell–Kiriakos (34), Dethier–Kiriakos (89), and, crucially, Arundell–Borrell (Arundell several times mentions Mr Borrell, the author's 'friend', in *Discoveries*).

(i) From the notebook commentary to 84: *In v. 7. interpretatur Böckh. εἰ μὴ ἂν, ἐπέειξεν τέκνους ἡμῶν nisi si res urgeat et sepulchris usus sit necessarius liberis nostris.* (Not. ad tit. 3774.) *Hoc durius videtur. Accipio constr. εἰ μὴ τέκνους, et ἐπέειγω immanente sensu dictum, ut in loco Josephi (Bell. Jud. III. p. 845F) ab Hasio citato... Explicatio altera cuius meminit Böckh. stare nequit.*

The published version (*Fasciculus*, vol. 2, no. 255): *Εἰ μὴ etc. in v. 7 interpretatur Böckh. Nisi si res urgeat et sepulchris usus sit necessarius liberis nostris. Vide notam ad n. 3774. 12. Hoc minus probaverim [...] Libentius accipio constructionem εἰ μὴ τέκνους, cum ἔἂν ἐπέειξεν interposito, hoc est, premente occasione, scil. si non alium locum sepulturae habeant. Vide Joseph. Bell. Jud. III. 5. 2. fin (Hasii p. 845B). Explicationis alterius meminit Böckh. quae nullo pacto stare potest.*

(ii) From the notebook commentary to 156: *Sordes Fellowsianas, quas et Franzius expressit, vix opus est ut conferam. vid. Lyc. p. 409 n. 159.*

The published version (*Fasciculus*, vol. 3, no. 314): *Edidit Franz. ('Ubi supra p. 148 n. 4270. in libr. Fellows. p. 409 n. 159') secundum Fellowsii apogr. expressum, ideo sordibus obpletum.*

(iii) From the notebook commentary to 187: *Edit. Franz. p. 158 n. 4303e ex Murator. T. II. p. MLX. n. 6 et Princip. Turris Mutiae, Inscr. Sicul. Cl. XIV p. 172. n. 12. Mire hunc titulum video Messanae addictum a Muratorio in loc. cit.*

The published version (*Fasciculus*, vol. 3, no. 296): *Editum video a Franzio ex Muratorio et Principe Turris Mutiae ('Ubi supr. p. 158 n. 4303e. Locus Muratorianus est tom. II. p. MLX n. 6. Turrimutian. Inscr. Sicul. Cl. XIV. p. 72. n. 12'), a quibus utrisque miro errore Messanae Siculorum attributus fuerat.*

In these passages, as often elsewhere, the notebook commentator uses the first person singular, as does Bailie. One might, in theory, have entertained a notion that someone other than Bailie acquired Borrell's notebook and copied Bailie's Latin commentary material into it as if it were his/her own, first person and all; but a key passage in the commentary added to 66 (*Fasciculus*, vol. 3, no. 359*a*) testifies against this. After three introductory sentences square brackets contain textual remarks about 'the copy Borrell sent me' (*apogr. quod ad me misit Borr.*). Here we see a specific instance of the general pattern identified earlier: Borrell sending copies to interested scholars, as well as amassing transcripts in his own notebook. What differentiated Bailie from von Prokesch-Osten, Philippe Le Bas and others was that he subsequently acquired the notebook itself.

Furthermore, Bailie used the notebook in other places than the second and third volumes of *Fasciculus*. On 12 June 1851 and 26 June 1851 James Kennedy Bailie read to his fellow-Members of the Royal Irish Academy his most elephantine paper to date: 'Memoir on two large medallion busts which are preserved in the manuscript room of the library of Trinity College, Dublin; as also on two inedited Patmian inscriptions extracted from the collection formed by the author during his travels through Anatolia and the neighbouring islands of the archipelago in 1840, 1841'.<sup>75</sup> The first three of its six sections, on the two inscribed Trinity busts, need not concern us here, but pp 190ff are a different matter. There Bailie presented texts, with commentary, of three of the documents from Borrell's notebook, principally the two Patmian items (4 and 5), with, as a pendant to the

<sup>75</sup> *TRIA* 22 (1848–55), Polite Literature, 85–292 (summarised in *PRIA* 5 (1850–53), 127–30 and 136–7).

second of these, one from Kos (129). All three are proffered as ‘inedited’. Actually, all three had been published in the 1840s, 4 and 5 in Ludwig Ross’s *Inscriptiones Graecae ineditae* (IGI) and 129, before Ross, by Colonel Leake (see Abbreviations and Appendix for details). It is possible that Bailie was ignorant of these facts rather than attempting to conceal them; one can at least give him the benefit of this doubt. His claim, however, that he had copied these items himself a decade earlier and was only now bringing his work to public attention, I regard as bogus.<sup>76</sup> First and in general terms, neither from the summaries of his itinerary given to the Academy in 1842 and 1843 nor from anywhere else would one have supposed that he ever visited Patmos or Kos, or indeed any of ‘the neighbouring islands of the archipelago’. Secondly and specifically, while the massive ‘armchair’ erudition that he brought to bear on these two Patmian documents was altogether his own, I can find nothing about the texts themselves that he could not have derived from the notebook. On the contrary: when he claims, in respect of 4, to have made two or even three transcripts before leaving the stone, these generally turn out to be those of Dr Sinclair and David Ross, as reproduced by Borrell.<sup>77</sup> I feel certain that a more authentic glimpse of the truth of the matter is vouchsafed us on p. 226, concerning 5: ‘it appears from the uncial copy of this inscription, that of the ninth and tenth lines only twenty-one letters were discernible on the marble’.

When did Bailie acquire Borrell’s notebook? As indicated above, I believe that he did so before the end of 1846. The basis for this is the addition of reference numbers, in pencil, to most of the documents on pp 134–72 (items 154–204). These seem to be in Bailie’s hand, although certainty on that point is made difficult by the great difference between the thick, soft pencil used here and the fine pen-and-ink deployed in the transcripts and commentaries. The prime reason for using such a soft pencil appears to have been the ease of rubbing it out. This has certainly occurred on, for example, p. 152 (183 and 184), where ‘281 c’ and ‘282 d’ have replaced a still-legible ‘278’ and ‘279’. Here we have Bailie revising the reference numbers of the inscriptions in the third volume of *Fasciculus* as he went along—and there was more revision to come: these two documents were eventually published as nos 283 c and 284 d.<sup>78</sup>

### 9. From Smyrna to Stewartstown

I left open in my introductory comments the question of how a notebook used and filled in the Levant during the second quarter of the nineteenth century could have turned up, apparently during the third quarter of the twentieth century, in County Tyrone, Northern Ireland.

<sup>76</sup>Bailie’s claims to have seen and copied 4 and 5 for himself are both explicit and implicit throughout, save for what looks like a revealing slip (concerning 5) on p. 226: see further below. With regard to 129 his phraseology is more guarded: ‘has long lain amongst my papers’ (p. 221); ‘has long slumbered in my portfolio [...] it was copied from a marble in Antimachia’ (p. 233).

<sup>77</sup>See for example his apparatus criticus on line 13: [Copy] 1, ΔΙΑΙΥΤΑΔΙΑΙ ΧΕΙΜΕΡΟΝΙΑΔΗ. [Copy] 2, ΑΙΤΑΙΟΥΤΑ Σ ΣΑΡ ΟΥΔΥΣ ΧΕΙΜΕΡΟΝΟΙΑΔΑ.’ According to the notebook, this is exactly what was copied by Sinclair and Ross respectively.

<sup>78</sup>The point need not be laboured with any more examples. Let it suffice to say, summarily, that there are 51 such pencil numbers, all of them likewise a little lower (by decrements of 1–9) than the numbers eventually published in *Fasciculus*. The appended letters stay the same in all but a few cases.

In an endeavour to explain this—to find a link between H.P. Borrell (once it was clear that the book was originally his) and Ulster—I focussed initially on Borrell's fellow-enthusiast David Ross of Bladensburg. Ross and Borrell do indeed come across as kindred spirits, both generous in their willingness to share and spread their findings.<sup>79</sup> Ross, it seems, had done with travelling and had headed back home to Rostrevor before 1836.<sup>80</sup> This is earlier than the latest of the dates mentioned, in Borrell's hand, in the notebook (1841); but it is not implausible for Borrell to have sent the notebook to his friend, for remembrance's sake, a few years after their parting. Alternatively, the book could have been a bequest, coming to Ross on Borrell's death in 1851;<sup>81</sup> the problem with this, however, is that it is pure conjecture, lacking a shred of even circumstantial evidence.<sup>82</sup>

In any event, during the course of this investigation a vastly more attractive hypothesis has come into play, in which the central figure is not David Ross of Bladensburg but James Kennedy Bailie. That Ross ever possessed Borrell's epigraphic notebook could only have been a theory; that Bailie possessed it, as I have shown, is a fact.<sup>83</sup> A second relevant fact is geographical: the close proximity, in space if not in time, between the two Church of Ireland clerics, James Bailie and David Bothwell (from whose widow the present owner of the notebook acquired it; see p. 73 above).

Bailie's parish was Ardtrea, which skirts the western side of Lough Neagh; Ardtrea village itself is some four miles north of Stewartstown, Co. Tyrone. Bothwell's parishes of Ballyclog and Donaghen(d)ry, nowadays combined with that of Brackaville (Coalisland), lie immediately to the south of Ardtrea parish,<sup>84</sup> in and immediately to the north of Stewartstown itself. Could Revd Bothwell have acquired the notebook in some manner—unverifiable at this remove—that involved the Armagh diocese of the Church of Ireland? He surely could. However, an even more precise and more satisfactory explanation of its reaching him can be constructed.

<sup>79</sup>Ross is by far the most important supplier of items in the notebook. In addition to the 30 inscriptions for which a copy by Ross is the explicit source (4, 5, 39, 43, 57, 85, 97, 98, 99, 107, 108, 111, 117, 124, 125, 129, 130, 132, 140, 144, 149, 152, 153, 154, 155, 159, 169, 189, 197, 200) there are 31 others for which this is a strong probability: those where Bailie and/or LW refer to an identical transcript as Ross's (100, 131, 133, 171, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186, 187, 188, 190, 191, 192, 193, 194, 195, 196, 199, 201, 202, 203, 204). I am inclined to think the same, too, of the rest of the material from Kos and Rhodes, which might have been systematically credited to Ross but is not (109, 110, 112, 113, 114, 115, 116, 118, 119, 120, 121, 122, 123, 126, 127, 128, 134, 135, 136, 137, 138, 139, 141, 142, 143, 145, 146, 147, 148, 150, 151).

<sup>80</sup>He is listed, for 1836, as one of Rostrevor's four working Justices of the Peace: see *OSMI*, vol. 3, *Parishes of County Down I, 1834–6: South Down* (1990), 26–39 ('Parish of Kilbroney—Memoir by J. Hill Williams, October 1936').

<sup>81</sup>Also in 1851 (according to Bernard Burke, *A genealogical and heraldic history of the landed gentry of Ireland*, 1919 edn), Ross's elder cousin and namesake, David Ross, the sometime MP for Belfast (see note 16 above), died, and Ross of Bladensburg purchased the part of his property that included Rostrevor.

<sup>82</sup>If any such evidence did ever exist, it is now beyond retrieval: see Whitehead, 'David Ross of Bladensburg', 99.

<sup>83</sup>For notebook items with a Bailie commentary not published in the *Fasciculus* (or anywhere else, to my knowledge), consult the Appendix.

<sup>84</sup>See, for example, the map on p. vi of *OSMI*, vol. 20, *Parishes of County Tyrone II, 1825, 1833–5, 1840: Mid and East Tyrone* (1993).



When I asked Bronagh Liddicoat, Revd Bothwell's daughter, for her ideas as to how her father might have acquired such an item, she recalled in the first instance his habit of browsing second-hand bookstalls in, for example, Cookstown and Belfast, but she then went on to make a suggestion of another kind (letter of 26 September 1997):

[...] my father received several small collections of books at various times from the local 'big houses'. One such collection came from Mullantean in the 1970s, when Mrs Gausson had died and her daughter Eileen, as the sole family survivor in Stewartstown, was moving from the family home to an adjacent retirement bungalow.

James Glendinning later confirmed and amplified this information (letter of 3 November 1997):

Miss Eileen Gausson was very friendly with the Bothwells, and on more than one occasion paid their electricity and coal bills. There was apparently a large collection of books in Mullantean but when Miss Gausson grew older and felt unable to look after her large house, she sold it and moved into a small bungalow. At this stage, a sale of her possessions took place in Cookstown Town Hall. Afterwards she claimed that she made more from this sale than from selling the house. I assume that it was at this stage that the book passed into Revd Bothwell's possession.

This assumption becomes very compelling indeed if we properly explore (as I have done) the Mullantean connection.

The Irish branch of the Gaussons, first of all, were descended from a Huguenot family of the Languedoc who fled France in 1685 and settled in Counties Down (Newry) and Derry (Ballyronan, on the Lough Neagh shoreside).<sup>85</sup> Exactly three hundred years later, in 1985, the *Belfast Telegraph* published a feature about the Gaussons, which included an interview with the then 81-year-old 'Miss Eileen Gausson of Stewartstown, the last surviving member of the Gausson family in the Ballyronan area'.<sup>86</sup> Miss Gausson (who died in August 1988) was the daughter of Dr David Gausson, a medical practitioner in Dunmurry, Belfast, and 'Ethel Kennedy of Stewartstown'; and the article went on to speak of Ethel Kennedy Gausson's 'family home in Stewartstown, a large Georgian building much of which was destroyed in recent times by a fire'.<sup>87</sup> Though unnamed as such, this is Mullantean, which was thus a Kennedy family home.

As we know, James Bailie, before his change of name, was a Kennedy; and a box of documents (D.2315) in the Public Record Office, Northern Ireland (PRONI) shows that this is anything but a coincidence. The documentation is described by R.J. Hayes in his *Manuscript sources for the history of Irish civilisation* (where I first

<sup>85</sup>See generally Grace Lawless Lee, *The Huguenot settlements in Ireland* (London, 1936), 196–7.

<sup>86</sup>*Belfast Telegraph*, 4 November 1985; I am indebted to James Glendinning for a photocopy of the article.

<sup>87</sup>James Glendinning informs me that after the fire, the result of a terrorist attack, both the land and the remains of the house were sold off separately, and I have seen for myself (in December 1997) that only a pair of modestly ornamental gates now remain.

became aware of its existence) as ‘Papers relating to the families of Kennedy, Bailie and Magill of Artrea [*sic*], Stewartstown area, Co. Tyrone, from 17th century’.<sup>88</sup> Box D.2315, when I examined it in the PRONI, turned out to contain the following: ‘c. 918 documents consisting of title deeds, testamentary papers, correspondence, estate and legal papers etc. of the Gausson, Kennedy, Bailie and Magill families of Mullantean, Stewartstown, Co. Tyrone 1669–1965. Presented by Miss Eileen Gausson, Mullantean, Stewartstown, Co. Tyrone’. Most of this material is not germane to the present enquiry, but one may say, summarily, that it reveals a complex and longstanding nexus of intermarriage between the four families named (between the Bailies and the Kennedys, for example, from as early as 1738). Against that background we meet, as family members, both Revd Thomas Kennedy Bailie (Vicar of Kilmore, Co. Down) and his nephew, Revd James Kennedy Bailie; the latter’s books and miscellaneous correspondence are represented too;<sup>89</sup> and there is detail to augment the statement in *DNB* (vol. 30, p. 423; see note 37 above) that when Bailie died, unmarried, on 18 January 1864, he left ‘his property’ to a nephew. D.2315/2/15 is a copy probate of Bailie’s will (of 11 September 1861) containing this bequest, and we discover there the nephew’s name: Charles George Blgrave Kennedy (the eldest surviving son of James’s brother William, who had died in 1843). ‘I give to the said Charles George Blgrave Kennedy’, declares Bailie, ‘the whole of my books writings and papers and all the bookcases in my library’. Charles Kennedy<sup>90</sup> married ‘Charlotte Magill of Mullantean’<sup>91</sup> and died (aged 65) in October 1905, leaving her, in his own will, everything including ‘books’ (D.2315/2/39). A son of theirs was Lieutenant-Colonel William Magill Kennedy (1868–1923) of the Indian Army, who died a violent death on the subcontinent in the very year he had merited an entry in *Thom’s Irish who’s who* (London and Dublin, 1923; see p. 123). That he played any part in Miss Gausson’s inheritance of James Kennedy Bailie’s academic effects, including Borrell’s epigraphic notebook, need not be supposed. Rather, the line of transmission passes through Miss Gausson’s mother, Ethel (more exactly Ethelind) Kennedy Gausson, mentioned earlier. She was Charles and Charlotte Kennedy’s only daughter, named in a codicil to her father’s will as the ultimate heiress to her parents’ property if her brother William were to die without issue—which, to the best of my knowledge, he did. Thus, when Dr David Gausson of Dunmurry died, in 1938, his widow returned to what was now her house, Mullantean, and in due course it passed to her unmarried daughter Eileen Charlotte Gausson.<sup>92</sup>

<sup>88</sup>R.J. Hayes, *Manuscript sources for the history of Irish civilisation: first supplement, 1965–1975* (Boston, Mass., 1979), 388.

<sup>89</sup>The books are his editions of Homer mentioned earlier. The letters are a miscellany of correspondence written and (especially) received by him from 1827 onwards; they contain, alas, nothing either from or concerning Borrell.

<sup>90</sup>A family tree in Charles Kennedy’s own hand (D.2315/9/6C), dated to 1872, contains the following remark concerning his uncle: ‘this gentleman was my uncle, to whose estate I have succeeded [...] I have followed his example in assuming the name and arms of Bailie’. In none of the documents in D.2315, however, is he so styled.

<sup>91</sup>I quote from the 1865 premarriage settlement between them (D.2315/1/127).

<sup>92</sup>A visitor to St Patrick’s Church, Donaghendry (as I was in December 1997), may still see, inside, the family pew (with plaques commemorating William Magill Kennedy and his niece Eileen Gausson) and, in the cemetery, the black marble grave pillar of ‘Charles George Blgrave Kennedy of Mullantean’ and his wife Charlotte (1846–1927).

That a notebook first owned and filled by an expatriate Swiss-Englishman in nineteenth-century Turkey should have turned up, a hundred and fifty-odd years later, in Northern Ireland is thus not the mystery that at first sight it seemed.

The first and longest stage of its journey from Smyrna to Stewartstown, the one from Henry Borrell's own hands to the 'museum'<sup>93</sup> of James Kennedy Bailie in Ardrea Glebe House, is established by the simple fact of Bailie's handwritten additions to the book itself. After Bailie's death it passes to his nephew and heir, Charles George Blgrave Kennedy, who, within a year or so, becomes by marriage the master of Mullantean. There it is inherited (very likely unwittingly) first by Charles Kennedy's widow, Charlotte, then by his daughter, Ethelind Kennedy Gausson, and ultimately by his granddaughter, Eileen Gausson.

The final step is its passage from Miss Gausson to her friend and neighbour, Revd David Bothwell. For this, even circumstantial evidence fails us, and more than one scenario must be deemed possible. Perhaps it was simply cleared out of Mullantean, so that, after all, Revd Bothwell did pick it up by chance at a second-hand stall in Cookstown or elsewhere. I prefer, though, to visualise a more direct transfer, either in 1965, when Miss Gausson put together the archive that she presented to the PRONI, or else, and more attractively, in the 1970s, at the general sale of Mullantean and its contents.<sup>94</sup> Either way, the recipient (and penultimate owner) of the notebook was Miss Gausson's local rector, who, as she well knew, was just the man to relish such an antiquarian item. Did Revd Bothwell realise, in more than general terms, what he had and how it came to be there? Was Miss Gausson herself aware that this anonymous notebook had been owned and annotated (not to mention plagiarised) by her great-grand-uncle James Kennedy Bailie? Although I suspect that the answer to both these questions may be negative, the story of this 'numismatist's epigraphic notebook' has now, to the best of my ability, been told.

#### ABBREVIATIONS

<i>CIG</i>	August Boeckh and Johannes Franz (eds), <i>Corpus inscriptionum Graecarum</i> (4 vols, Berlin, 1828–77).
<i>CIL</i> III	Theodor Mommsen (ed.), <i>Corpus inscriptionum Latinarum</i> (Berlin, 1863–), vol. 3, <i>Inscriptiones Asiae, provinciarum Europae Graecarum, Illyrici Latini</i> (Berlin, 1873).
<i>CISem.</i>	Ernest Renan <i>et al.</i> (eds), <i>Corpus inscriptionum Semiticarum</i> (Paris, 1881–).
<i>Discoveries</i>	F.V.J. Arundell, <i>Discoveries in Asia Minor</i> (2 vols, London, 1834).
<i>DNB</i>	Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee (eds), <i>Dictionary of National Biography</i> (63 vols and 6 suppl. vols, London, 1885–1912).
<i>Fasciculus</i>	J.K. Bailie, <i>Fasciculus inscriptionum Graecarum</i> (3 vols, London and Dublin, 1842–9).
<i>GIBM</i> IV	C.T. Newton <i>et al.</i> (eds), [ <i>A catalogue of</i> ] <i>Greek inscriptions in the British Museum</i> (4 vols, London, 1874–1916), vol. 4 (1916), ed. F.H. Marshall.
<i>Hellenika</i>	Ludwig Ross, <i>Hellenika</i> (2 vols in 1, Halle, 1846).
<i>IAlexTroas</i>	Marijana Ričl, <i>The inscriptions of Alexandria Troas</i> (Bonn, 1997).

<sup>93</sup> Bailie ended the prefaces to all three volumes of his *Fasciculus* with the words *dabam ex museo meo*.

<sup>94</sup> For this second possibility see the letter (3 November 1997) of James Glendinning quoted above. Bronagh Liddicoat (letter of 26 September 1997), too, favours this explanation. She herself acquired two nineteenth-century items, a diary and a photograph album, on this occasion.

- IBNH J.-P. Lobies *et al.*, *Index bio-bibliographicus notorum hominum, pars C: corpus alphabeticum, secto generalis* (Osnabrück, 1973–).
- IG II<sup>2</sup> Johannes Kirchner (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 2, *Inscriptiones atticae Euclidis anno posteriores* (2nd edn, 4 vols, Berlin, 1913–40).
- IG IX.1 Wilhelm Dittenberger (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 9, part 1, *Inscriptiones Phocidis, Locridis, Aetoliae, Acarnaniae, insularum maris Ionii* (Berlin, 1897).
- IG X.2 C.F. Edson (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 10, part 2, fasc. 1, *Inscriptiones Thessalonicae et vicinae* (Berlin, 1972).
- IG XI.4 Pierre Roussel (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 11, part 4, *Inscriptiones Deli* (Berlin, 1914).
- IG XII.1 Friedrich Hiller von Gaertringen (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 12, part 1: *Inscriptiones Rhodi, Chalces, Carpathi cum Saro, Casi* (Berlin, 1895).
- IG XII.3 Friedrich Hiller von Gaertringen (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 12, part 3, *Inscriptiones Symes, Teutlussae, Teli, Nisyri, Astypalaeae, Anaphes, Therae et Therasiae, Pholegandri, Cimoli, Meli* (Berlin, 1898).
- IG XII.5 Friedrich Hiller von Gaertringen (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 12, part 5, *Inscriptiones Cycladum* (Berlin 1903).
- IGI Ludwig Ross, *Inscriptiones Graecae ineditae*, vol. 1 (Nauplia, 1834), vol. 2 (Athens, 1842), vol. 3 (Berlin, 1845) (*non vidi*).
- IGRRP René Cagnat *et al.* (eds), *Inscriptiones Graecae ad res Romanas pertinentes* (4 vols in 3, Paris, 1906–27).
- IKnidos Wolfgang Blümel (ed.), *Die Inschriften von Knidos* (Bonn, 1992).
- IMylasa Wolfgang Blümel (ed.), *Die Inschriften von Mylasa* (2 vols, Bonn, 1987–8).
- ISmyrna Georg Petzl (ed.), *Die Inschriften von Smyrna* (2 vols, Bonn, 1982–90).
- ITralleis F.B. Poljakov (ed.), *Die Inschriften von Tralleis und Nysa* (Bonn, 1989).
- JHS *Journal of Hellenic Studies*
- Larfeld Wilhelm Larfeld, *Griechische Epigraphik* (3rd edn, Munich, 1914).
- Leake W.M. Leake, ‘Inscriptions copied in Cos by Lieut. Helpman’, *Transactions of the Royal Society of Literature*, 2nd series, 1 (1843), 1ff (*non vidi*).
- LW Philippe Le Bas and W.H. Waddington, *Inscriptions grecques et Latines recueillies en Asie Mineure* (Paris 1870; reprinted Rome, 1968, and Hildesheim, 1972).
- Lycia (Sir) Charles Fellows, *An account of discoveries in Lycia* (London, 1841).
- MAMA W.M. Calder *et al.* (eds), *Monumenta Asiae Minoris antiqua* (9 vols, London, 1928–88).
- OSMI Angélique Day and Patrick McWilliams (eds), *Ordnance Survey Memoirs of Ireland 1830–40* (40 vols, Belfast and Dublin, 1990–8).
- Paton/Hicks W.R. Paton and E.L. Hicks, *The inscriptions of Cos* (Oxford, 1891).
- PRIA *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy*
- RPh *Revue de Philologie*
- SEG J.J.E. Hondius [later others] (ed.), *Supplementum epigraphicum graecum* (Leiden, 1923–71; Alphen, 1979–80; Amsterdam, 1982–).
- SGDI Herman Collitz (ed.), *Sammlung der griechischen Dialekt-Inschriften* (4 vols in 6, Göttingen, 1884–1915).
- Syll. Wilhelm Dittenberger (ed.), *Sylloge inscriptionum Graecarum* (3rd edn, 4 vols, Leipzig, 1915–24; reprinted Hildesheim, 1982).
- TAM Rudolf Heberdey *et al.* (eds), *Tituli Asiae Minoris* (5 vols, Vienna, 1901–89).
- TRIA *Transactions of the Royal Irish Academy*
- Voyage arch. Philippe Le Bas, *Voyage archéologique en Grèce et en Asie Mineure [...] pendant les années 1843 et 1844* (3 vols in 5, Paris 1847).

## Appendix

## The notebook's inscriptions

I have numbered the inscriptions in bold here in the order in which they appear in the notebook; each inscription number is followed, in parentheses, by the page number(s) as marked, in pencil, in the notebook itself. The inscriptions themselves, which I have not reproduced here, are in Greek unless otherwise stated. 'T' indicates a miniscule transcript (in a later hand unless otherwise stated), 'C' indicates a (later) commentary.

I have not striven for bibliographical completeness. Under each item I simply aim to cite (a) significant nineteenth-century publications (such as *CIG*), which may or may not include the *editio princeps*, and (b) at least one more modern mode of reference, if available. As will be seen, I have found publications in either or both of these categories in all but five cases: **14** (Thessalonica); **109** and **127** (both Cos); **146** (Rhodes); **151** (Rhodian Peraia). Where no volume number is cited in multi-volume epigraphical corpora (such as *CIG*, *Fasciculus*, *LW*), item numbers are consecutive throughout the whole work. For full details of abbreviated bibliographical sources, see the list of Abbreviations on pp 99–100.

**1** (2). 'Inscription near the 3rd well going to the E. on leaving Severissar. Copied by Mr R.' [One might naturally take him, credited again under **2**, to be David Ross-of-Bladensburg (**4** and *passim*), but Baillie, in *Fasciculus*, no. 159 (and no. 158 = **67** below), gives the name as Rothwell. For Thomas Rothwell see section 7 above.] Pencil index: 'Teos'. Honorific decree, reign of Augustus; 15½ lines from bottom left, with inkwash drawing of the stone itself. (a) *CIG*, no. 3080; *Fasciculus*, no. 159; *LW*, no. 107. (b) ?none.

**2** (4). 'Inscription near the 2nd well going to the E. of Severissar. Copied by Mr R'. [See under **1**.] Pencil index: 'Teos'. Honorific decree for the emperor Antoninus Pius, AD 138 or later; final two lines, with inkwash drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 161; *LW*, no. 98. (b) ?none.

**3** (6). 'Inscription on a fragment on a well going to the East out of the Village of Severissar'. Pencil index: 'Teos'. Dedication to the emperor Hadrian on an architrave, AD 117–38; fragments of two lines, with pencil drawing of the architrave itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 160; *LW*, nos 96–7. (b) *Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique* 46 (1922), 329, no. 8 (*SEG*, vol. 2, no. 586).

**4** (7–8). 'Inscription found on the island of Patmos in 1832. Copied from the Journal of Dr Sinclair HM Brig Cordelia' (p. 8). 'The same inscription from Patmos as on the next page, but copied by Mr D. Ross' (p. 7; a pencil hand fills out the name as David Ross of Bladensburg). T, C. Honorific inscription, in elegiac couplets, for the hydrophoros Bera (Vera), third/fourth century AD. (a) *IGI*, no. 190; Georg Kaibel, *Epigrammata Graeca ex lapidibus conlecta* (Berlin, 1878), no. 872. (b) *SGDI*, no. 5024; *SEG*, vol. 39, no. 855 (cf. no. 854).

**5** (10). 'Also from the Journal of Dr Sinclair from Patmos'. (Additions and underlinings in pencil collate this copy with 'a copy taken by D Ross of Bladensburg'.) T, C. Honorific decree of lampadistai (torch-racers) for Hegemandros Menekratou, second century BC. (a) *IGI*, no. 189. (b) *Syll.*, no. 1068; G. Manganaro, 'Le iscrizioni delle isole milesie', *Annuario della Scuola Archeologica di Atene* 25/6 (1963/4), 293–394, no. 32.

**6** (12). 'Fragment of an inscription inside of a Sarcophagus at the Scala of Voula near the site of Clazomenae'. Dedication to two emperors; final five fragmentary lines, with outline sketch of the stone itself. T. (a) *CIG*, no. 3130, *Fasciculus*, no. 132; *LW*, no. 36. (b) *IGRRP*, vol. 4, no. 1549; Helmut Engelmann and Reinhold Merkelbach (eds), *Die Inschriften von Erythrai und Klazomenai, I–II* (Bonn, 1972–3), no. 514.

**7** (14). 'Inscription on the pedistal [*sic*] of a statue found on the island of Anaphy'. (Under an almost identical lemma—'on the pedistal of a statue of a female'—the inscription is repeated on p. 18.) Dedication by Simias Telesikratous, on his mother's behalf, to Apollo Pythios and Artemis Soteira. (a) *CIG*, no. 2481. (b) *IG XII.3*, no. 268.

**8** (14). 'Inscription copied at the island of Teno. Journal of M. de Cadalven[e]. In the court of the Monastery of Evangelhisma'. T, C. Honorific decree for Aurelios Satyros, ?second century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 2336b. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 951.

9 (16). 'From Ak-Hissar. Thyatira of Lydia'. Marble sarcophagus of Phabios Zosimos, imperial period. (a) *CIG*, no. 3509; *Fasciculus*, no. 15 with Add. (at vol. 2, 176–7). (b) *TAM*, vol. 5, no. 1142 with photo (with full bibliographical history).

10 (18). 'Inscription at Corfu'. T, C. Dedication by the people of Kerkyra to mark their 'liberation' [sc. from Norman occupation] by (Em)manuel I Komnenos, AD 1149. (a) *CIG*, no. 8733. (b) None of the whole, but its last line has generated a spurious copy on terracotta (F. Lenormant, *Rheinisches Museum für Philologie* 21 (1866), 403, no. 297; W. Vischer, *Rheinisches Museum für Philologie* 22 (1867), 624; *IG IX.1*, no. 1040). (I owe these references to Profs Karanastassi and Tsougarakis of the Ionian University of Corfu, who opine, *pace IG IX.1* (Dittenberger), that the full version is bogus as well as the copy.)

11 (20). 'Inscription, uncertain where found. In my possession'. Dedication of Herakles-statue by Papias Diogenes, Roman period. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 107; *CIG*, no. 3912 *a*; *LW*, nos 741 (Hierapolis) and 1571 (Mylasa). (b) *IMylasa*, no. 334.

12 (20). 'Another, place of discovery also uncertain'. 'The above inscription was afterwards copied at Koula [Lydia], thus'—i.e. two copies. (French hand adds: 'publié [in 1831] par Keppel, t. II, p. 346'.) Offering to the god Men Aziottenos after a dispute over wine. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 167; *CIG*, no. 3442. (b) *TAM*, vol. 5, no. 251 (with full bibliographical history); G. Petzl, 'Die Beichtinschriften Westkleinasiens', *Epigraphica Anatolica* 22 [1994], no. 60.

13 (22). 'Inscription found at the island of Amorgos [...]' (for the continuation of this quotation see above, section 3). Cadalvène's translation, T, C. Honorific decree of Milesians resident in Aigiale for Agathon Dikaiarchou, ?imperial period; opening thirteen lines. (a) *CIG*, no. 2264. (b) Julius Delamarre (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin, 1873–), vol. 12, part 7, *Inscriptiones Amorgi et insularum vicinarum* (Berlin, 1908), no. 402.

14 (24). 'sepulchral inscription from Thessalonica'. Grave monument for Adeas Samou, Thrason Dimnou, Adeas Archedaou and Thrason Archedaou. (The last patronymic is perhaps Archelaou, i.e. Α for the transcript's clear Δ.) Apparently unpublished. (Not in *IG X.2*)

15 (24). 'Inscription from the island of Teno. From Journal of M de Cadalvène—1837'. Commemoration of priestly offices, first or second century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 2339. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 903.

16 (24). 'Another at same place'. (French hand adds: 'transporté à Athèn[e]s, au temple de Thesée'.) Herm of Herakles, bearing the (?)later dedication of a maritime association. (a) *CIG*, no. 2339 *b*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 912 (with detailed drawing).

17 (26). 'Inscription on a column from the ruins of Lyttus in Crete'. Dedication by polis of the Lyttioi to Plotina, wife of the emperor Trajan, AD 112–13. (a) *CIG*, no. 2575. (b) Margherita Guarducci (ed.), *Inscriptiones Creticae* (4 vols, Rome, 1935–50), vol. 1, section xviii, no. 31.

18 (28). 'From a sepulchral stone from the neighbourhood of Smyrna in my possession. Sent to England in 1836, and now the property of Dr Lee'. Funerary monument of Theodotos and others, imperial period; outline sketch of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 150; *LW*, no. 26. (b) *JHS* 62 (1942) 16, VIIb, no. 1; *ISmyrna*, no. 226.

19 (28). 'At Smyrna'. Statue-base for the priestess Ulpia Marcella (cf. *CIG*, no. 3507), second century AD. (A note adds: 'The name of the same priestess occurs in an inscription copied by Smith and cited by Peyssonnel—Smiths inscription is in Muratori page DLIII'.) Outline sketch of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 141; *CIG*, no. 3508; *LW*, no. 5 (with discussion of whether the true provenance is Smyrna or Thyateira). (b) *TAM*, vol. 5, no. 996 (cf. no. 995 for the inscription copied by T. Smith).

20 (30). 'From a Sarcophagus at the Dardanelles, originally from Alexandria Troas. Copied March 1825'. (Added in pencil: 'Collated with a copy by Mr Le Dr Bighy in 1833'.) Grave monument of Aur. Tatianos and his family, imperial period. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 186; *CIG*, no. 3588 *b*; *LW*, no. 1035 (giving the doctor's name as Digby—but the notebook version, above, seems clear). (b) *IAlexTroas*, no. 102.

21 (30). 'On an altar brought from the plains of Troy, now in the Castle of the Dardanelles'. Statue-base commemorating the early career of Sex. Quinctilius Valerius Maximus, reign of Trajan. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 190; *LW*, no. 1037; *CIL* III, no. 384. (b) Hermann Dessau (ed.), *Inscriptiones Latinae selectae* (3 vols in 5, Berlin 1892–1916; reprinted Berlin, 1954–5, and Dublin, c. 1974), no. 1018; *IAlexTroas*, no. 39. Cf. Pliny, *Epistles*, 8.24 with A.N. Sherwin-White, *The letters of Pliny* (Oxford, 1966), 477–80.

22 (32). 'Inscription copied at Aidin Guzel Hissar (Tralles), on a column of about two feet in diameter in the possession of the British Consular Agent'. (Added below: 'Arundell in his Seven Churches copied this Inscription [in the epigraphical appendix to the Notes]. It differs in a few letters from mine'.) Commemoration of the athletic victories of Gaius Lic[ini]us Inventus, third century AD or later. (a) *CIG*, no. 2935; *Fasciculus*, no. 111; *LW*, no. 598. (b) *ITralleis*, no. 113.

23 (34). 'On the Capital of a Column also at Aidin Guzel Hissar (Tralles)'. Honorific commemoration for Gaius Iulius Philippus, second half of second century AD. The copyist stopped after the first three lines. (a) *CIG*, no. 2933; *Fasciculus*, no. 112; *LW*, no. 605. (b) Wilhelm Dittenberger (ed.), *Orientalis graeci inscriptiones selectae* (2 vols, Leipzig, 1903–5), no. 501; *ITralleis*, no. 50.

24 (34). 'On a marble fragment brought from Nymphia'. Public commemoration of Herakleides Lysiponou; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 138; *LW*, no. 34. (b) ?none. (Territorially ineligible for inclusion in *ISmyrna*: see vol. 1, p. ix, note 12.)

25 (34). 'In the temple of Theseus at Athens is preserved a small white marble funerary Cippus representing a female seated on a chair raising her veil with her right hand, while a female is presenting to her an infant swaddled up. The faces are very much disfigured. With this inscription [in Greek and Phoenician]. Copied from the journal of J R Steuart Esqr. [whose comments on the Phoenician script are then quoted]. Epitaph of Erene of Byzantium, first half of fourth century BC. (a) Not in *CIG*; for *Inscriptiones Graecae* (Berlin 1873–), vol. 2, part 3 (Berlin, 1888), no. 2858, Ulrich Koehler (ed.) cites individual editions of the Greek text and *CISem.*, vol. 1, no. 120. (b) *IG* II<sup>2</sup>, no. 8440; Christoph Clairmont, *Classical Attic tombstones* (Kilchberg, 1993), vol. 2, no. 849.

26 (36). 'From a marble at Eski Hissar on the road from Boli to Tocat'. Pencil index: 'stratoniceia', but actually Hadrianopolis in Bithynia. Honorific commemoration of the emperor Hadrian by the tribe I Apollonis, AD 124–5. Latin translation added by the copyist. (a) *CIG*, no. 3802; *Fasciculus*, no. 42; *LW*, no. 1183. (b) ?none.

27 (36). 'At the island of Siphanto (Siphnus) in a grotto'. Indication that the place belongs to Nymphs. (a) *CIG*, no. 2423 c. (b) Hermann Roehl (ed.), *Inscriptiones Graecae antiquissimae* (Berlin, 1882), no. 399; *IG* XII.5, no. 483.

28 (36). 'At Astypalaea, on an ancient altar in the chapel of Panaya Theotoco—from the journal of M de Cadalvene et Breuvery'. T. C. Dedication to Asklap(i)os by Archemenidas, 'made' by Timocharis of Eleutherna, late third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2491 b. (b) *IG* XII.3, no. 186.

29 (38). 'Inscription on a marble from Eski Hissar'. Pencil index: 'Stratoniceia', but actually Hadrianopolis in Bithynia. Honorific commemoration of the imperial freedman *cubicularius* Euphemus, ?reign of Hadrian. Latin translation added by the copyist. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 43; *CIG*, no. 3804; *LW*, no. 1184. (b) ?none.

30 (38). 'Inscription over a magazine door in the fruit bazar [*sic*] of Smyrna'. Christian prayer for universal mercy and peace. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 148; *LW*, no. 31; *CIG*, no. 9280. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 852.

31 (40). 'Fragment from Zea. Ancient Ceos'. Translations (Latin and French), T (by the copyist himself as well as the later hand), C. Decree of the Keians granting citizenship and associated rights to the Aitolians, c. 220 BC; first sixteen lines. (a) *CIG*, no. 2352. (b) *IG* XII.5, no. 532; *Syll.*, no. 522, III. Cf. 52 below.

32 (42). 'Inscription on a marble built in the walls of a Turkish Mosque at Salgiclar'. Pencil index: 'Eucarpia (Phrygia)', but *LW* attribute it to Sebaste. Honorific commemoration of the envoys Kapiton Sokratous and his son. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 246; *CIG*, no. 3871 b; *LW*, no. 731. (b) ?none.

33 (42). 'Another at Issicli, perhaps the ancient Eumenia'. Pencil index: 'Eumenia (Phrygia)'. Penalty-clause of a grave monument; last three lines. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 240; *CIG*, no. 3902; *LW*, no. 740. (b) ?none.

34 (42). 'Another from the Governor's [lodgings] at the same place [...] from the journal of M. Kiriako [cf. 89]. Mr Arundell has published the same [in *Seven Churches*, epigraphical appendix to the Notes] but gives it as follows'—i.e. two copies. Pencil index: 'Eumenia (Phrygia)'. Grave monument of Hermes (?]rmes Arundell). (a) Fuller versions in *Fasciculus*, no. 239; *CIG*, no. 3893 with Add; this single-line version in *LW*, no. 738. (b) J.H.M. Strubbe, *Avai epitymbioi* (*Inscripfen griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien*, Band 52 [1997]), no. 289 with bibliography.

35 (42). 'Another at Issicli, or Ischicli'. Pencil index: 'Eumenia (Phrygia)'. Fragment of the

- (?)penalty-clause of a grave monument. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 241; *CIG*, no. 3901 with Add; *LW*, no. 739. (b) ?none.
- 36 (44). 'On a square block of marble at Zea [Keos]'. Dedication to Apollo by [N]ikeratos, fourth or third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2366. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 548.
- 37 (44). 'On a square marble at Zea [Keos]'. Karthaia honours Julius Caesar, in or after 48 BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2368. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 556.
- 38 (44). 'Another on a square marble at Zea [Keos]'. Karthaia honours Julius Caesar, in or after 46 BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2369. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 557.
- 39 (46). 'Two sorts of characters on a Tomb at Antipheli. Copied from the journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg. Novr 1833'. Ink index (Lycia): 'Antiphellus'. T, C. Grave monument, in Lycian and Greek, of Ikhtta and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 266 (both versions); *CIG*, no. 4300*h*; *LW*, no. 1273. (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 56.
- 40 (46). 'At Astypalea in the court of the Monastery of Panaya Portaristissa at the foot of stair case on a fragment of a Column. From journal of MM Cadalvene and Breuvery'. T, C. Astypalaia honours Polyuktos. (a) *CIG*, no. 2488*c*. (b) *IG XII.3*, no. 213.
- 41 (46). 'Another at same place, from same journal'. C. Dedication to Diktyinna by Timokleia. (a) *IGI*, no. 155. (b) *IG XII.3*, no. 189.
- 42 (46). 'Another at Castel of the same island'. T, C. Base commemorating Hierophon. (a) *CIG*, no. 2490 (fuller version). (b) *IG XII.3*, no. 228 (fuller still).
- 43 (48). 'On a tomb at Gunuk or Xanthus [in Lycia]. Also from the journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. Four-sided Lycian grave monument. (a) See (b). (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 40 (collating earlier work by Fellows *et al.*).
- 44 (50). 'On a marble at Zea [Keos]'. T, C. Keian decree in honour of Philotheros of Halai, third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2356. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 533 = no. 1066. (Cf. 51 below: same stone.)
- 45 (50). 'Another at Zea'. T. Dedication to Apollo by Tellias. (a) *CIG*, no. 2365. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 547.
- 46 (50). 'A Zea sur un petit bas relief representant une figure étendue et le coude appuyé sur une bas de colonne—journal de MM Cadalvene et Breuvery'. T. Grave(?) monument of Epaphrodeitos. (a) *Voyage arch.*, no. 1795. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 638.
- 47 (50). 'A Zea. Sur un petit autel tres bien conservé, même journal'. T, C. Altar for the empress Livia, 31–27 BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2370 with Add. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 628.
- 48 (52). 'From Zea'. List of names, fifth century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2363*b*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 607.
- 49 (52). 'At Andros, upon a small square altar, from the journal of M. de Cadalvene'. Altar for the emperor Hadrian, AD 117–38. (a) *CIG*, no. 2349*m*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 741.
- 50 (52). 'Another at same island from same journal'. C. Honours for the priest Attalos Dionysiou, first century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 2349*f*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 752.
- 51 (54). 'From Zea [Keos]'. T, C. Karthaia honours Hegesikles of Kythnos, third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2357. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 534. (cf. 44 above: same stone.)
- 52 (56). 'From Zea'. C. Decree of the Naupaktians, c. 220 BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2359*b*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 527*B*, *alterum exemplar* (*Syll.*, no. 522, II). Cf. 31 above.
- 53 (56). 'Another from Zea'. (Fragment of) honorific decree of Karthaia, third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2350. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 535.
- 54 (58). 'From Zea'. T, C. Delos honours a citizen of Karthaia, ?third century BC; last fifteen lines. (a) *CIG*, no. 2272. (b) *IG XI.4*, no. 1048.
- 55 (60). 'From Zea'. Commemoration of a gymnasiarchy, third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2367*d*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 620.
- 56 (60). 'Another from Zea'. Dedication to Hermes by the ex-gymnasiarch Theoteles, ?third century BC. (a) *CIG*, no. 2367*c*. (b) *IG XII.5*, no. 621.
- 57 (60). 'Inscription found lately at Athens. March 1831. Communicated by D Ross of Blad[ensburg]'. T, C. Statue-base for the deified empress Livia, soon after AD 29. (a) *CIG*, no. 313, citing individual editions (Maffei. *Mus. Veron.*, p. 480.4 [Donatus p. 240.4], *Stuartus Ant. Att.* I, pp 2, 6) inconsistent with a recent find. (For Francesco Scipione, Marchese di Maffei (1675–1755) see Larfeld, 23, and further *SEG*, vol. 30, no. 1808, vol. 31, no. 1658). (b) *IG II<sup>2</sup>*, no. 3238.
- 58 (62). 'On a marble in my possession brought from Giera the ancient Aphrodicea [Aphrodisias]



in Caria. Jan[uar]y 1831'. Honours for the athlete Menandros, imperial period; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *CIG*, no. 2811; *Fasciculus*, no. 48; O. Liermann, *Analecta epigraphica et agonistica* (Halle, 1889), 26 (*non vidi*). (b) C.M. Roueché, *Performers and partisans at Aphrodisias* (London, 1993), no. 85.

**59** (64). 'Inscription on a sepulchral stone in my possession brought from the environs of Smyrna'. Grave monument of Theodoros Theodorou and his family, imperial period. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 152; *LW*, no. 22. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 316.

**60** (64). 'On a small slab of varigated [*sic*] marble in my possession from the vicinity of Smyrna'. Grave monument of Neike, imperial period. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 144; *LW*, no. 23. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 367.

**61** (64). 'From the ruins of Tralles [in Lydia/Caria]'. Initiates honour Ti. Claudius Glyptos, third century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 2926, *Fasciculus*, no. 113; *LW*, no. 604. (b) *IGRRP*, vol. 4, no. 1341; *ITralles*, no. 74.

**62** (66). 'On a sepulchral stone in my possession from the vicinity of Smyrna'. Grave monument of Aur. Tryphon and his family, third century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 3411; *Fasciculus*, no. 149. (b) *JHS* 62 (1942), 15–16, no. VIIa; Thomas Ihnken, *Die Inschriften von Magnesia am Siplyos* (Bonn, 1978), no. 24; *ISmyrna*, no. 260.

**63** (68). 'Inscription découverte par M. le Baron Wolff qui fixe probablement le site de l'ancienne Prynnessus [in Phrygia Magna] à Seidighass [Seid-el-Ghazil], entre Eskicheir et Afium Karahissar [...]. The letters which are merely traced by dots have been added by Mr Abraham, and were obliterated in the original'. Prynnessus honours P. Aelius Claudianus Niger. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 245; *CIG*, no. 3818; *LW*, no. 793. (b) ?none.

**64** (70). 'Sepulchral inscription on an ancient altar brought from the ruins of Cnidus. In my possession'. Grave-monument of Damo. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 90; *LW*, no. 513. (b) *SGDI*, no. 3535*a*; *IKnidus*, no. 443; P.M. Fraser, *Rhodian funerary monuments* (Oxford, 1977), 118–19 (with photograph of this and **65**).

**65** (70). [Same heading as **64**, since presented as a single document.] Grave monument of Dionysas Dionysados of Knidos from Rhodes. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 91; *LW*, no. 513. (b) *SGDI*, no. 3535*b*; *IKnidus*, no. 444; Fraser (see under **64**).

**66** (70). 'Inscription on a small square piece of bysalt [*sic*] from Egypt'. C (specifying Alexandria). Dedication by Ioul(ios) [Tei]marchos, 13 BC. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 359*a*; *CIG*, no. 4938*b*. (b) ?none.

**67** (72). 'Fragment of an inscription at Teos'. Honours for the priestess Claudia Tryphaina, first century AD or later; outline sketch of the stone itself. (a) *CIG*, no. 3092, *Fasciculus*, no. 158; *LW*, no. 110. (b) Louis Robert, *Études anatoliennes* (Paris, 1937), 24–5.

**68–77** (74). 'Uncertain characters written on the rocks (or inscribed valley) at Wadi Mokattib twelve hours distant from Mount Sinai. The rocks are covered with these inscriptions for more than a league. To no. 1 [**68**] there is beneath a Greek inscription, but I am inclined to think it is of a date posterior to the others, perhaps inscribed by some pilgrim, as there are other Greek inscriptions which bear the cross attached to it'. Graffiti, consisting mostly of name and blessing-formula, written in a script and language now identified as Arabic-influenced Nabataean Aramaic; second–third century AD. See generally Joseph Naveh, *Early history of the alphabet: an introduction to West Semitic epigraphy and palaeography* (Jerusalem and Leiden, 1982), 3 and 157–8 with fig. 143 and pl. 21. (a) *CIG*, nos 4668*a*, cf. nos 4668*b–i* and 4669 (for the Greek). (b) *CISem.*, vol. 2, nos 490–3233 (for the Nabataean material as a whole).

**78** (76). 'Cette Inscription se lit renversée sur le mur d'une ancienne mosquée au sud de Smyrne et a la droite du grand cimetaire, a mi chemin de Sedikui, le lieu est nommé Kammeno Djami—Copié par Monsieur Dethier, il y a pres de la un grand mure de fortification et une ancienne chaussée'. Christian grave monument for Archbishop Aitherichos, mid-fifth century AD. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 34; *LW*, no. 30; *CIG*, no. 8618. (b) *SEG*, vol. 18, no. 550; *ISmyrna*, no. 559.

**79** (76). 'Inscription on a fragment dug up in the Jewish quarter of the city of Smyrna'. Grave or honorific monument for [Ti]mothea Heraiou, third–first century BC; outline sketch of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 143; *LW*, no. 17. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 121.

**80** (76). 'Fragment found at the same time and place as the last'. Part of a list of (?)contributors, ?second–first century BC; outline sketch of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 146; *LW*, no. 3. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 693.

**81** (78). 'Sepulchral inscription from Amphipolis'. Grave monument of Aur. Torquatus for his wife

and family, second–third century AD. (a) *Voyage arch.*, no. 1421. (b) *Bulletin of the [London] Institute of Classical Studies* 10 (1963), 17–18, no. 1 (*SEG*, vol. 24, no. 598).

**82** (78). ‘Sepulchral inscription brought from Salonica, besides the inscription is the usual representation of a figure reclining on a couch, a boy holding a vessel which he offers to the reclining figure, and a female sitting—below is also several implements of a Mason or builder, as a trowel or plumb and line, a measure etc. the whole of very barbarous execution’. (a) *Voyage arch.*, no. 1381. (b) *IG X.2*, no. 670.

**83** (80). ‘Inscription built in the walls of a Turkish mosque at Bournabat, 6 miles N. of Smyrna’. Verse-inscription in praise of the River Meles, probably reign of Marcus Aurelius. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 28; *CIG*, no. 3165. (b) *IGRRP*, vol. 4, no. 1389; *ISmyrna*, no. 766. (On the identification of the River Meles see G.E. Bean, *Aegean Turkey* (London, 1966), 45–7.)

**84** (82). ‘Nicomédie’ (Bithynia). T, C. Grave monument of Aelius Septimius Severus and his wife. (a) *CIG*, no. 3785, *Fasciculus*, no. 255. (b) *TAM*, vol. 4, no. 234.

**85** (84). ‘Inscription at Xanthus from the Journal of D Ross of Bladensburg’. (One side of) the ‘Xanthos Stele Inscription’, summarising the exploits of ?Kherei; late fifth/early fourth century BC. (a) See (b). (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 44, B (= east side), collating earlier work by Fellows *et al.* In the notebook’s transcript some lines are missing.

**86** (86). ‘Inscription on a Column at Mylasso [Mylasa, in Caria]’. T, C (both by the copyist himself). Commemoration of the benefactor Menandros Ouliadou. (a) *CIG*, no. 2698; *Fasciculus*, no. 106. (b) *SEG*, vol. 34, no. 1071; *IMylasa*, no. 402.

**87** (86). ‘Inscription brought from a short distance from Nymphia about 14 miles [east] of Smyrna’. Grave monument for Pyrrhos Apollonios of Alexandria. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 139; *LW*, no. 35. (b) ?none. (See above, under **24**.)

**88** (88). ‘Tronçon de Colonne apporté de Bournabat pour servir à la bâtisse de l’église grecque de St. Dimitri à Smyrne. Copiée en xbre 1833 par A. Dethier.’ C (by the copyist). Milestone commemorating road repairs by the emperor Claudius, AD 51; inkwash drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 153; *LW*, no. 6. (b) *CIL* III, no. 476 with David Magie, *Roman rule in Asia Minor* (Princeton, 1950), 547 with note 22; *ISmyrna*, no. 825.

**89** (90). ‘Inscription prise dans l’itinéraire de Monsieur le Baron Wolff. Le lieu d’existence n’est pas connu’. Second reading by ‘Monsieur Kiriakos Phédros de Smyrne’ (cf. **34**). ‘This inscription was found at Prymnessus’ (in Phrygia; cf. **63** above). Dedication to the infernal gods and Thundering Zeus. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 244 (‘habeo et apographa Detherii et Kyriaki Phaedri, Graeci Smyrnensis, quorum hoc absolutissimum est’); *CIG*, no. 3819 with Add. (b) *MAMA*, vol. 5, no. 225.

**90** (92). ‘Inscription trouvée à Suleimani Kalossi près de Kisbeuck par Arundell and Dethier en 9bre 1832. Sur un fragment de marbre dans les décombres d’une temple ionique’: [...] *TEMPLUM* [...] [...] *ΚΑΑΥΔΙΟΥ* [...]. C (by the copyist). (a) *CIG*, no. 3869; *Fasciculus*, no. 247 (both with slightly fuller texts than the notebook’s, and both assigning the document to Phrygia). (b) ?none.

**91** (94). ‘Fragment d’une inscription sur le porte du château d’Ouloubourlou, laquelle traite de l’érection d’une statue’. Pencil index: ‘Apollonia (Pisidia)’. Apollonia honours the wife of Aur. Apollonius with a statue; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *CIG*, no. 3970 with Add; *Fasciculus*, no. 237; *LW*, no. 748 (= no. 1195). (b) *IGRRP*, vol. 3, no. 318, and cited in *MAMA*, vol. 4, no. 150 (see next entry).

**92** (94). ‘Inscription copiée dans la cour du papas grec, dans le château d’Ouloubourlou [...]. Copiées [i.e. this and **91**] en 9bre 1832 par Mr. Arundell and Dethier. Ces deux inscriptions fixent sans contredit la position d’Apollonie des Lyciens des Thraces à Ouloubourlou’. Apollonia honours Aur. Apollonius with a statue; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Discoveries*, vol. 1, 243 and 245 (cf. William Smith, *Dictionary of Greek and Roman geography* (2 vols, London, 1854–7), vol. 1, 161); *Fasciculus*, no. 236; *CIG*, no. 3969; *LW*, no. 747. (b) *IGRRP*, vol. 3, no. 317; *MAMA*, vol. 4, no. 150.

**93** (96). ‘Fragment d’une inscription décisive pour l’emplacement d’Apamée [Apamea, in Phrygia], découverte en 9bre 1832 par Mr. Arundell à Dinaire. Sur un fragment de colonne dans une cimetièrre’. End of Latin dedication by (?) *negotiatores*; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Discoveries*, vol. 1, 192 (cf. Smith (see under **92**), vol. 1, 153); *Fasciculus*, no. 235; *LW*, no. 746. (b) *CIL* III, no. 365.

**94** (98). ‘Inscription trouvée en 9bre 1832 par Arundell and Dethier et qui fixe de manière décisive l’emplacement de la ville d’Antioche de Pisidie à Jalabash’. T. Latin inscription commemorat-

ing the careers of L. Flavius Longus and L. Flavius Paulus; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Discoveries*, vol. 1, 287–8 (cf. Smith (see under **92**), vol. 1, 147; *Fasciculus*, no. 249; LW, no. 1190. (b) *CIL* III, nos 298–9.

**95** (100). 'A Smyrne dans un cimetière près du pont des Caravanes'. Beginning of honorific or funerary inscription for [?]Kalli]as Kallippou, third–first century BC; inkwash drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 142; LW, no. 14. (b) *ISmyrna*, no. 46.

**96** (102). 'In my possession. Found in digging the foundation of the house for the Greek ex Patriarch in Smyrna in 1833'. T. Part of a decree promulgated against a ferryboat cartel, perhaps first–second century AD; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 140; LW, no. 4; *GIBM* IV, no. 1021 with photo ('acquired at the Borrell Sale, August 26, 1852'). (b) *Syll.*, no. 1262; *IGRRP*, vol. 4, no. 1427; F.F. Abbott and A.C. Johnson, *Municipal administration in the Roman Empire* (Princeton, 1926), 387, no. 70; *ISmyrna*, no. 712.

[?] On p. 103 of the notebook Dethier comments on two grave monuments from Eucarpia (Phrygia) that evidently filled the missing pp 104–5:

[No.1] Exemple de la pierre sepulchrale d'une ancienne dame grecque. on y voit les attributs de son sexe, un miroir, un peigne, un fuseau et un ornement pour le col sur la face latérale. Sur la face principale sont deux rouleaux qui ressemblent à des manuscrits. peut être les symboles rappellent-ils une autre Sappho dont le nom et les [?]oeuvres nous sont restés inconnus. No. 2 est une colonne chrétienne de petite dimension, peut être servit-elle à un autel.

I cannot trace the second of these, but the first seems to have some connection with LW, no. 771–3 (*CIG*, no. 3857 *wxy*).

**97** (106). 'On a tomb at Gunuk. From journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. Lycian grave monument. (a) See *b.* (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 38 with no. 37 (collating earlier work by Fellows *et al.*).

**98** (106). 'On another tomb at Gunuk from D'. Lycian grave monument of Ahqqadi. (a) See (b). (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 36 (collating earlier work by Fellows *et al.*).

**99** (108). 'Inscription in uncertain characters [!] on a tomb at Antipheli [Antiphellus]. From the journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. Lycian grave monument. (a) See (b). (b) *TAM*, vol. 1, no. 55 (collating earlier work by Fellows *et al.*). Dr Antony Keen informs me that the notebook's transcription contains some anomalies.

**100** (110). 'On a tomb at Selenti' (Selinus, in Cilicia). T. Grave monument of Obrimos and Neon. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 128; *CIG*, no. 4428 with Add.; LW, no. 1386. (b) ?none.

**101** (110). 'On a tomb at Attalia' (in Pamphylia). T. Grave monument of M. Calpurnius Silanus and his freedmen. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 225; *CIG*, no. 4340 *g*; LW, no. 1366. (b) ?none.

**102** (110). 'Another at same place'. T. City dedication to the emperor Hadrian, AD 117–38. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 217; *CIG*, no. 4339 with Add.; LW, no. 1359 *bis*. (b) ?none.

**103** (110). 'Another at d[itt]o'. Grave monument of L. Calpurnius (?)Iuncus Silianus. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 226; *CIG*, no. 4341 with Add.; LW, no. 1365. (b) ?none.

**104** (110). 'Another at d[itt]o'. Commemoration of the death of the emperor Hadrian's sister Paulina by Julia Sancta (cf. **207**), after *c.* AD 133. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 218; *CIG*, no. 4340 with Add.; LW, no. 1360. (b) ?none.

**105** (110). 'Another'. T. Honorific career-inscription of the son of C. Licinius Flamm(a). (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 219; *CIG*, no. 4340 *f*; LW, no. 1362. (b) ?none.

**106** (110) [apparently on the same stele as **105**] Honorific career-inscription of the son of another C. Licinius. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 220; *CIG*, no. 4340 *g*; LW, no. 1363. (b) ?none.

**107** (112). 'Inscription at Cos on a gate of the Marina in distinct characters from journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. ('The corrections are from another copy from journal of Cadalvene—in other respects they perfectly agree'.) T, C. Cos honours P. Sallustius Sempronius Victor, late second or third century AD. (a) *CIG*, no. 2509 *a*. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 102.

**108** (112). 'On a votive altar from the same from D. R. of B. as above'. T, C. Dedication by Apollonius Apolloniou of Magnesia. (a) *CIG*, no. 2515. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 190.

- 109** (112). 'On another'. T, C. Dedication(?) by Gn. (?)Polliouphorios. Apparently unpublished.
- 110** (112). 'In a wall at same place'. T, C. Dedication by Herakleides Artemidorou of Alexandria. (a) *CIG*, no. 2516. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 191.
- 111** (114). 'Inscription from Cos. From journal of D R of Bladensburg'. T, C. Grave monument of a family of gladiators and huntsmen. (a) *CIG*, no. 2511. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 141.
- 112** (114). 'On another, both from the Church of Panaghia Gorgopoea—Cos'. T, C. Grave monument of the *oikonomos* Dionysios. (a) *CIG*, no. 2512. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 308.
- 113** (114). 'Another, road to Pile'. T. Grave monument of Hermione. (a) ?none. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 192 (who cite no prior publication).
- 114** (114). 'Another, on road to Pile'. T, C. Grave monument of Peisistratos and Euodos, father and son. (a) Leake, no. 24; *IGI*, no. 178 *a*. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 329.
- 115** (114). 'Another, road to Pile'. T, C. Grave monument of Antigonos and Theodoris. (a) Mentioned (without text) by R.P. Pullan in C.T. Newton, *A History of discoveries at Halicarnassus, Cnidus, and Branchidae* (2 vols in 3, London, 1862–3), vol. 2, 635. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 333.
- 116** (114). 'Another, town of Cos—in a cemetery [*sic*]'. T, C. Honorific decree for an ex-official, imperial period; right-hand side of last twelve lines. (a) *CIG*, no. 2508 (fuller version). (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 119 (likewise).
- 117** (116). 'Inscription at Church of St. Stavro in the village of Pile Anct. Olympia, island of Cos. From Journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. T, C. Marker-stone for sacred land and buildings. (a) *IGI*, no. 309. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 349.
- 118** (116). 'Another, same place'. T. Grave(?) monument of Zoilos. (a) *IGI*, no. 310. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 354.
- 119** (116). 'Another'. T, C. List of names with patronymics. (a) Leake, no. 10; *IGI*, no. 173. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 346.
- 120** (116). 'On block of marble at village Palio Castro in Cos—a Castle built by Knights of St John'. T, C. Thank-offering(?) by [Hek]ataios. (a) Leake, no. 33; *IGI*, no. 172 with plate. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 348.
- 121** (116). [under same heading as **120**] T, C. Grave monument(?) of Berenike. (a) Leake, no. 32; *IGI*, no. 178 *h*. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 353.
- 122** (116). [under same heading as **120**] T, C. Grave monument(?) of Herakleitos Kleukritou. (a) ?none (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 342 (who cite no prior publication).
- 123** (116). 'On an altar in the possession of M D'Avenat at Cos'. T, C. Grave monument(?) of Drakontis Mênandrou (MHNANΔPOY (*sic*)). (a) ?none. (b) Not in Paton/Hicks but recently published (with the obviously correct MENANΔPOY—see already Bailie's version in the notebook's p. 115) by Ernst Pfohl and Hans Möbius in *Die ostgriechischen Grabreliefs* (2 vols in 4, Mainz, 1977–9), no. 2236 (*non vidi*, but see *SEG*, vol. 29, no. 1678: 'Unknown provenance. Blue marble plaque with relief representing a serpent [appropriate to the deceased's name, Snakewoman]; above the serpent an inscription; once in the Evangelical School in Izmir, where [Josef] Keil drew and copied it in his Skizzenbuch VII 367').
- 124** (118). 'At Cos from journal of the same [see **117**]. At Kefalos most Southerly Village in Island'. T, C. Grave monument of the ex-official Straton. (a) Leake, no. 14. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 417.
- 125** (118). 'D'. T, C. Dedication to Vespasian by the villagers of Isthmos, AD 74. (a) *IGI*, no. 306. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 410.
- 126** (118). 'Another on a votive altar'. T, C. List of names with patronymics. (a) Leake, no. 22; *IGI*, no. 178 *d*. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 398.
- 127** (118). 'Another, on a marble Column at Cos'. T, C. Grave monument(?) of Menandros Menippou 'Selteus' (which is surely an error, by mason or copyist, for Selgeus, i.e. citizen of Selge in Pisidia). Apparently unpublished. For another Menandros Selgeus who died abroad see Johannes Nollé and Friedel Schindler, *Die Inschriften von Selge* (Bonn, 1991), no. 43 (*SEG*, vol. 14, no. 706), his grave monument from the Rhodian Peraia.
- 128** (118). 'On a square stone engraved on every side, each side probably the same [two are transcribed here]. Built in a wall from a village in Cos, Antimakia. From same journal'. T, C. Commemoration of the first year of the reign of Caligula, AD 37-8. (a) *Hellenika*, no. 14. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 391. L. Ross and Paton/Hicks print only the first of the notebook's two sides, and

minor differences in transcription show that **128**, **135**, **136**, and **137** were all seen by D. Ross and L. Ross independently.

**129** (120). 'From Cos. From journal of the same gentleman. Antimachia'. T, C. Honorific decree of a cult association. (a) Leake, no. 44; *IGI*, no. 175. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 382.

**130** (122). 'At Silenti [Selinus, in Cilicia: cf. **100**] on a tomb. From journal of D. Ross of Bladensburg'. Latin grave monument of the navy veteran C. Julius Celer. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 130; *LW*, no. 1387*bis*. (b) *CIL* III, no. 225.

**131** (122). 'Another at d[itt]o'. Grave monument of Koundes Deiou. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 129; *CIG*, no. 4424 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1387. (b) ?none.

**132** (122). 'On a Tomb at Kelendria [Kelenderis, in Cilicia]. From same journal. The second is from a copy made by Jens Pell Esqr.' On p. 121, 'another copy of the inscription at Kelendria from the journal of Monsieur Le Baron de Behr. May 1841'—i.e. three copies in all. T. Grave monument of Synegdemos *alias* Billos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 114; *CIG*, no. 4322 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1388. (b) ?none.

**133** (122). 'On a block at a place called Meidan 2 hours N. of Selekia [Seleukeia, in Cilicia]. Badly written and crooked'. T. Memorial of Athenodoros Diodotou. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 131; *CIG*, no. 4429*c*; *LW*, no. 1420. (b) ?none.

**134** (124). 'Church of Panaghia, island of Cos. On a block of marble. Antimachia'. T, C. Aurelius Rufus honoured by the villagers of Antimachia etc. (a) *IGI*, no. 307. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 394.

**135** (124). 'Another at same place'. T, C. Grave monument(?) of Aur. Zosimos. (a) *Hellenika*, no. 16. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 397. See above, under **128**.

**136** (124). 'At Monostary [*sic*] in Cos'. T, C. Dedication(?) by the unnamed gymnasiarch of a Sarapis cult. (a) Leake, nos 40–1; *Hellenika*, no. 13*B*. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 371*b*. See above, under **128**, and under the next entry.

**137** (124). 'On another stone [actually, the same stone] at same place. Inscribed within a[n] arch of laurel'. T. Dedication(?) by Zosimos Zosimou. (a) See under the preceding entry. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 371*c*. NB: the notebook (= D. Ross) and Leake have **136** and **137** as separate documents, L. Ross and Paton/Hicks have them as a single one (i.e. with Zosimos as the gymnasiarch).

**138** (124). 'Another'. T. Dedication by, or grave monument of, Aphrodisia Istriana. (a) Leake, no. 3. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 364.

**139** (124). 'At Ai[os] Georges in Cos. A ruined church in M[?]pountai[?]ns'. T, C. Grave monument of the Paconii family. (a) ?none. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 337 (who cite no prior publication).

**140** (126). 'Another at Aios Georges Church at Cos from journal of the same'. T, C. Grave monument, in verse, of [P]otheine. (a) ?none. (b) Paton/Hicks, no. 335 (whose fuller version cites no prior publication).

**141** (126). 'At Lyndus in Rhodes. On a votive altar'. T, C. Dedication by (?)the Lindians in recognition of an ex-priest. (a) *Rheinisches Museum für Philologie* 4 (1845), 181, no. 12 (L. Ross). (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 835.

**142** (126). 'At Lyndus near Church of St. Stephanus'. T, C. Dedication by the ex-priest Xenarchos Exakestou. (a) *IGI*, no. 272. (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 834.

**143** (126). 'At Lyndus'. T, C. List of names and patronymics. (a) *Archäologisch-Epigraphische Mitteilungen aus Oesterreich-Ungarn* 7 (1883), 137, no. 76 (E.M. Loewy). (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 765, col. B.

**144** (128). 'Inscription in Church of Panaghia Lyndus. From same journal'. T, C. Catalogue-style document. (a) *Voyage arch.*, vol. 2, 171, from D. Ross. (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 789 (where Hiller puzzles over whether D. Ross truly went to Lindos and toys with the source being L. Ross).

**145** (128). 'D. At Lyndus in the Garden of a Turk'. T. Grave monument of the son of Oroandus and his wife. (a) *Archäologisch-Epigraphische Mitteilungen aus Oesterreich-Ungarn* 7 (1883), 133, no. 62 (E.M. Loewy). (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 873.

**146** (128). 'D. In a Street at Lyndus'. T, C. Grave monument of Matrodoros of Myra. Apparently unpublished.

**147** (128). 'At fountain at Lyndus'. T. Grave monument of (?)Po[lydo]ros (ΛΠΟΛΛΟ—notebook) and Eunomia. (a) ?none. (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 882 (copied by Hiller himself).

**148** (130). 'Inscription in the Church of St. Spiridhia at Theologos a village in Rhodes'. Comments (by the copyist) on the varying size of the letters. T, C. Lists of priests, under various heads. (a) *IGI*, no. 277. (b) *IG* XII.1, no. 730.

- 149** (132). 'Another inscription in the Church of St. Spiridion [*sic*] at Rhodes—from same journal'. T, C. Lists of religious officials. (a) *IGI*, no. 276. (b) *IG XII.1*, no. 731.
- 150** (132). 'At Sorono in Rhodes on a votive altar'. T. Grave monument of Menandros of Magnesia (ΜΕΝΑΝΔΡΟΥ ΜΑΓΝΗΤΗΣ (*sic*)). (a) ?none. (b) *IG XII.1*, no. 712 (copied by Hiller himself, with ΜΑΓΝΗΤΟΣ); Tituli Camirenses (= Mario Segre *et al.*, *Annuario della Scuola Archaeologica di Atene* 27–9 (1949–51), 141–318), no. 168*b*.
- 151** (132). 'On an ancient tomb at Tatza, on the continent opposite Rhodes'. ('Tatza' I take to be the 'Datça' of P.M. Fraser and G.E. Bean, *The Rhodian Peraea and Islands* (Oxford, 1954), 64.) C. Grave monument of (?A)gnoia. Apparently unpublished; not in either Wolfgang Blümel, *Die Inschriften der Rhodischen Peraia* (Bonn, 1991), or Alain Bresson, *Recueil des inscriptions de la Pérée Rhodienne* (Paris, 1991).
- 152** (134). 'Inscription at Cnidus near the Theater, on a votive altar from same journal'. Dedication to 'Sarapi[s], Isi[s] and all gods' by Apollonidas of Alexandria, second–first century BC. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 89; *LW*, no. 511 ('extrait du journal de M. de Cadalvène'—but Bailie had had it, *via* Borrell, from Ross of Bladensburg's). *GIBM IV*, no. 818 (noting that the copy's first two lines had broken off before 1916). (b) *SGDI*, no. 3528; *IKnidus*, no. 186.
- 153** (134). 'At a small village called Staliano on River Guziazy, from same'. T. Grave monument of Letrodoros and others, imperial period; outline drawing of the stone itself. (a) *LW*, no. 512 (again asserting that the journal is de Cadalvène's, and concluding that the site is Kaunos). (b) *Bulletin Épigraphique* (1954), no. 229; *Bulletin Épigraphique* (1973), no. 446.
- 154** (134). 'Inscription at Patara [in Lycia] on a slab fallen out of a building, probably an Heraeum—from same'. T, C. Ancestral grave monument of M. Aur. Hierocles. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 309; *CIG*, no. 4292*b*; *LW*, no. 1267. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 441.
- 155** (134). 'Inscription on an arch at Gunuk (Xanthus) from same'. The Xanthians commemorate the emperor Vespasian, AD 74–9. T, C. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 313; *CIG*, no. 4271 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1254. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 270*C*.
- 156** (134). 'Near the same arch another inscription recording probl. the same circumstances'. T, C. The Xanthians commemorate the emperor Vespasian, AD 74–9. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 314; *CIG*, no. 4270 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1253. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 275.
- 157** (134). 'On same stone'. T, C. Claudia Ti[?]tiane commemorates Sextus. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 315; *CIG*, no. 4276 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1255. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 394.
- 158** (134). 'Another bit'. T, C. The Lycian *koinon* commemorates King Ptolemy of Mauretania, AD 23–40. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 312; *CIG*, no. 4269*b*; *LW*, no. 1250. (b) *TAM II*, 274.
- 159** (136). 'Inscription on a wall at Gunuk (Xanthus) from the same journal'. T, C. Xanthian statue-base in honour of the Roman governor C. Julius Saturninus, ?first century AD. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 316; *CIG*, no. 4272 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1256. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 277.
- 160** (136). 'At Phaselis—from journal of Jens Pell Esqr 1837'. T, C. Thank-offering to Paphians from [-]odotos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 311; *LW*, no. 1356 (attributing the document to Paphos). (b) ?none.
- 161** (136). 'In the Beys Garden at Boudroum [Halikarnassos]—journal of Cadalvène and Breuverie'. Honorific commemoration of Q. Aemilius Lepidus, 15–13 BC. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 93; *LW*, no. 506. (b) ?none.
- 162** (136). 'At same place'. Dedication to Zeus Akraios by Dionysios. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 95; *LW*, no. 501. (b) ?none.
- 163** (136). 'Another'. Honorific or funerary monument in hexameters, ?first century BC; beginnings of three lines. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 101; *LW*, no. 508. (b) Werner Peek, *Griechische Vers-Inschriften*, vol. 1 (Berlin, 1955), no. 906, with Louis Robert, *Gnomon* 31 (1959), 1–30: 9–10.
- 164** (138). 'In walls of a hovel at Gunuk (Xanthus), same journal'. T, C. Dedication of a statue by [?]Aichm]on, an ex-priest of the god Xanthos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 320; *LW*, no. 1261. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 296.
- 165** (138). 'Another in a wall of a house being mutilated—here also a bas-relief much injured by fire'. T, C. (?)Grave monument of Ptol<e>m[aios]. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 323; *CIG*, no. 4278*f*; *LW*, no. 1263. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 360.

- 166 (138). 'In wall of ruined tower at same place'. C. Grave monument or theatre seat of Poseidonios. T. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 324; *CIG*, no. 4278 g; *LW*, no. 1264. (b) ?none (not in *TAM*).
- 167 (138). 'At Boudroum, near the Theater. Journal of M. M. de Cadalvene et Breuverie'. Dedication of four *bathra* by Neon Demetriou and his son, ?first century BC. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 97; *LW*, no. 502. (b) D.H. French, 'A Sinopean sculptor at Halicarnassus', *Epigraphica Anatolica* 4 (1984), 82, no. 1.
- 168 (140). 'Inscription in Citadel at Gunuk (Xanthus) on stone inscribed on two sides'. T, C. Honours for the son and daughter of Ossybas from their family and friends. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 321-2; *CIG*, no. 4269 d; *LW*, no. 1260. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 283.
- 169 (142). 'Inscriptions in citadel [of Xanthus] built in wall, six stones all inscribed. 3 were too high for Mr R[oss] to copy, nor could he decypher them with spyglass. 2 of them 18 lines and one of 16 lines, the 3 others [here 169-71] are as follows'. T, C. Xanthian statue-base in honour of Ulpia Phila. (a) *Lycia*, 166; *Fasciculus*, no. 318; *CIG*, no. 4273; *LW*, no. 1258. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 300.
- 170 (142) T, C. Xanthian statue-base in honour of the wrestler Quintus Apolloniou. (a) *Lycia*, 167-8, *Fasciculus*, no. 317; *CIG*, no. 4274 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1257. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 303; *IGRRP*, vol. 3, no. 626.
- 171 (142) T, C. Dedication of a statue by an ex-priest of the god Xanthos. (a) *Lycia*, 167; *Fasciculus*, no. 319; *CIG*, no. 4275 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1259. (b) *TAM* II, no. 294.
- 172 (144). 'Inscription at Castel Rosa [Megiste, in Lycia] cut on rock much injured by salt water and air. A bas relief on the other side'. T, C. Offering by the ex-priestess (?) [Timo]the[a]. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 291; *CIG*, no. 4301 d; *LW*, no. 1269. (b) ?none.
- 173 (144). 'Broken votive altar at Castel Rosa bearing following inscription'. T, C. Offering by Polema to the dead son of her master. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 292; *CIG*, no. 4301 c; *LW*, no. 1270. (b) ?none.
- 174 (144). 'Sepulchral Inscription on a Sarcophagus much defaced at Antiphili [Antiphellus, in Lycia]'. T. Fragmentary grave monument. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 272; *CIG*, no. 4300 l; *LW*, no. 1283. (b) ?none.
- 175 (146). 'Inscription very much defaced at Antiphili'. T, C. Grave monument of Epaphrodeitos and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 269; *CIG*, no. 4300 f; *LW*, no. 1278. (b) ?none.
- 176 (146). 'In a circle or wreath on a Sarcophagus at same place'. T, C. Grave monument of Euclthon and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 270; *CIG*, no. 4300 g; *LW*, no. 1279. (b) ?none.
- 177 (148). 'Sepulchral inscription also at Antipheli'. T, C. Grave monument of Apollonios and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 268; *CIG*, no. 4300 d; *LW*, no. 1276. (b) ?none.
- 178 (148). 'Another sepulchral inscription from the same place'. T, C. Grave monument of the agent Eutychos and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 267; *CIG*, no. 4299 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1275. (b) ?none.
- 179 (150). 'Inscription at Antipheli. Much defaced'. T, C. End of grave monument of (?) a slave; first three lines in a cartouche, here sketched in miniature. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 271; *CIG*, no. 4300 k; *LW*, no. 1281. (b) ?none.
- 180 (150). 'Inscriptions found at Cacova and Tristoma on the coast of Lycia. Tristoma is in the same bay as Cacova about an hours distance from it'. Ink index: 'Aperlai' (Lycia). T, C. Dedication to the emperor Titus and inauguration of a bath-house and portico, AD 80. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 273; *CIG*, no. 4300 w; *LW*, no. 1292. (b) ?none.
- 181 (152). 'Cacova and Tristima [sic] Inscriptions Continued'. T, C. Grave monument of (?) Eutychiane. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 287; *CIG*, no. 4303 h7; *LW*, no. 1309. (b) ?none.
- 182 (152). 'At Cacova'. T, C. Grave monument of (?) rimaros and his wife. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 282; *CIG*, no. 4303 g with Add. = no. 4300 p; *LW*, no. 1307. (b) ?none.
- 183 (152). 'At Cacova on a tomb'. T, C. Grave monument of (?) Meltine and her family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 283; *CIG*, no. 4303 h4; *LW*, no. 1302A. (b) ?none.
- 184 (152). 'On same tomb'. T. Grave monument of Aur. Markianos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 284; *CIG*, no. 4303 h4; *LW*, no. 1302B. (b) ?none.
- 185 (154). 'On a Tomb at Tristoma'. T, C. Grave monument of the slave Epaphrodeitos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 281; *CIG*, no. 4288 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1303. (b) ?none.
- 186 (156). 'Tristoma Inscriptions continued'. T, C. Ancestral grave monument of Aur. Epiktetos. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 285; *CIG*, no. 4303 h5; *LW*, no. 1306. (b) ?none.

- 187** (156). 'Another'. T, C. Grave monument of Archedemos and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 296; *CIG*, no. 4303 $e$  with Add.; *LW*, no. 1314. (b) ?none.
- 188** (156). 'Another'. T, C. Grave monument of Aurelia [?Ba]thylla and her family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 286; *CIG*, no. 4303 $h6$ ; *LW*, no. 1305. (b) ?none.
- 189** (158). '[Five] Inscriptions from Evassari a ruined place W. of Cacova and only separated from it by a promontory. Evassari is probably the site of the ancient city of Aperiae [Aperlai] in Lycia. On the basement of a Heroum at Evassari'. Below: 'All the inscriptions mark'd (1) belong to a considerable building in the shape of a small Temple and ornamented in a similar manner, one of the inscriptions shows that it was an Heroum. Those mark'd (1a) are parts of an inscription on the freize [sic]. (D Ross's Journal)'. T, C. Grave monument of, and commemoration of her doctor husband by, Herpidase *alias* Sarpedonis. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 275 (heröon) and nos 277–8 (frieze); *CIG*, no. 4289 with Add. (heröon) and 4300 $g$  (frieze); *LW*, nos. 1297–8. (b) ?none.
- 190** (160). 'This inscription is on the same monument as those on the preceding page'. T, C. Grave monument of Platonis. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 276; *CIG*, no. 4290 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1299. (b) ?none.
- 191** (160). 'Another inscription on the same Heroum as the preceding'. T, C. Grave monument of (?)Ernous and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 279 [misprinted there as no. 229]; *CIG*, no. 4300 $r$ ; *LW*, no. 1308. (b) ?none.
- 192** (162). 'On a Column of red granite in a wall of modern construction in a tower of the fortress at Evassari'. T, C. Commemoration by the polis of Aperlai of the tetrarchic emperors, AD 293–305. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 274; *CIG*, no. 4300 $x$ ; *LW*, no. 1293. (b) ?none.
- 193** (162). 'Sepulchral inscription at Evassari'. T, C. Grave monument of (?)Histone and her family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 280; *CIG*, no. 4300 $s$ ; *LW*, no. 1300. (b) ?none.
- 194** (164). 'Inscriptions at Myra [in Lycia]. Over a Bas-relief in middle of Theater at Myra, large letters'. T, C. Dedication to the city's Good Fortune and (?)Zeus of Victory. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 293; *CIG*, no. 4303 $b$  with Add.; *LW*, no. 1310. (b) ?none.
- 195** (164). 'In a Christian burial ground at Myra in very large characters about two inches long'. T, C. Byzantine Christian grave monument, mid-eleventh century AD. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 298; *CIG*, no. 8707–8; *LW*, no. 1316. (b) ?none.
- 196** (164). 'Two Inscriptions [now taken to be just one] found in burial ground at Myra near where Theater and Tombs in Rock—on a Column'. T, C. Decree concerning the ferry crossing between Myra and its port Andriake. (a) *Fasciculus*, nos 294-5; *CIG*, no. 4302 $a$ ; *LW*, no. 1311. (b) ?none.
- 197** (166). 'About an hour from Monastery of Agio Nicolo Myra are ruins on the banks of a River called Andraki. Ruins on sea side, but not in the Bay of Myra but in a bay called with reason Βρωμολιμνον [?Stinking Harbour?].—Here Mr R saw many tombs with inscriptions but very much defaced. He copied the following with great difficulty'. T, C. Grave monument of Aur. Sou[r]jos and his wife. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 297; *CIG*, no. 4303 $e2$ ; *LW*, no. 1315 (reproducing the words quoted above, and expanding 'Mr R' as David Ross-of-Bladensburg; I agree, cf. **169**, though a different expansion is called for in 1–2). (b) ?none.
- 198** (166). 'Inscription at Pheneka [Limyra, in Lycia] much defaced'. T, C. Grave monument of (?)Antonia for herself and her husband. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 289; *CIG*, no. 4307 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1320. (b) ?none.
- 199** (166). 'Inscription found at Deli[k]tash (Olympus) [in Lycia]. Sepulchral'. T, C. Grave monument (altar) of M. Aur. Demetrios and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 302; *CIG*, no. 4325 $d$  (section  $a$ ); *LW*, no. 1348A. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 1031. (On the name Deliktash, Pierced Rock, see G.E. Bean, *Turkey's southern shore* (London, 1968), 173.)
- 200** (168). 'Inscription found at Deli[k]tash (Olympus)—journal of David Ross of Bladensburg'. T, C. Grave monument (altar) of Hermaios and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 300; *CIG*, no. 4325 $c$ ; *LW*, no. 1344. (b) *TAM* II, no. 956.
- 201** (168). 'Another Inscription at Olympus—from same journal'. T, C. Grave monument (altar) for the household of Archepolis and Philokrates. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 301; *CIG*, no. 4325 $b$ ; *LW*, no. 1345. (b) *TAM* II, no. 1068.
- 202** (168). 'Another at same place, or Deliktash as it is written in journal of Jens Pell Esqr 1837'. T. Heñon of Philokrates and his family. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 303; *CIG*, no. 4325 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1347



(attributing the text to Ross; the copyist thus mentions Pell, above, purely for the form of the name).

(b) *TAM* II, no. 1154.

**203** (170). 'The following inscriptions were found on a sepulchral monument at Olympus'. Ink sketch of the tomb itself, under an arch upon two columns (cf. the lemma in *LW*, no. 1346, below). T, C. Grave monument of Aurelios Pigres. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 304; *CIG*, no. 4305 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1346. (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 947, I–IV.

**204** (172). 'The following inscription also copied from the same sepulchral monument as the inscription on the preceding page. It runs down the column marked F on the rough sketch [see under **203**: the left-hand column in the sketch]'. Below, a note that line 19 was omitted by the mason and added to the base. T, C. Gnomonic sayings in iambic verse, one for each letter of the alphabet. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 305 (with his own Latin version); *CIG*, no. 4310 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1339 (reproducing the observation about line 19). (b) *TAM*, vol. 2, no. 947, V–VI.

**205** (174). 'Inscriptions at Adalia or Attalia [in Pamphylia; cf. **101–6**] found in water at differ[en]t places'. Laudatory commemoration of the emperor Hadrian. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 216; *CIG*, no. 4339*b*; *LW*, no. 1359. (b) ?none.

**206** (174). 'Very imperfect and up side down'. C. Grave monument. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 227; *CIG*, no. 4340*d*; *LW*, no. 1367. (b) ?none.

**207** (174). 'On a stone set in a tower near Porta Aurica at Adalia'. Plaque commemorating the financing of the tower by Julia Sancta (cf. **104**), ?reign of Hadrian. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 224; *CIG*, no. 4340*h*; *LW*, no. 1361. (b) ?none.

**208** (176). 'Inscriptions at Adalia Continued. The following two Inscriptions of same piece broken off same block at the entrance of the Golden Gate'. T. Inscription commemorating the 'salvation' of the city by the Byzantine emperor Theodore I Lascaris, AD 1216. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 223; *CIG*, no. 8743; *LW*, no. 1370. (b) ?none.

**209** (176) T. Commemoration of the embellishment of a gate, sixth–seventh century AD. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 222; *CIG*, no. 8662; *LW*, no. 1369. (b) ?none.

**210** (178). 'Inscriptions at Adalia Continued. The two following are broken, disfigured and difficult to decypher'. T. Grave monument. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 228; *CIG*, no. 4340*e*; *LW*, no. 1368 ('très-fruste et difficile à lire'). (b) ?none.

**211** (178) T. Honorific base summarising a public career. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 221; *CIG*, no. 4340*b*; *LW*, no. 1364. (b) ?none.

**212** (180). 'At Eski Adalea on a pedistal [*sic*], from journal of Jens Pell Esqr'. Pencil index: 'Side' (Pamphylia). T. Statue-base commemorating Cyrenia Patra, wife of Bryonianus Lollianus. (a) *Fasciculus*, no. 233; *CIG*, no. 4346 with Add.; *LW*, no. 1385. (b) Johannes Nollé, *Side im Altertum, I: Geographie, Geschichte, Testimonia, griechische und lateinische Inschriften* (Bonn, 1993), no. 45, cf. no. 7; Louis Robert, 'Inscriptions grecques de Sidè en Pamphylie', *RPh* (1958), 15–53: 19–20.